

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION	
Docket #	W-3324
Staff	Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP
Petitioner(s)	The Housing Authority of Winston-Salem
Owner(s)	Same
Subject Property	PIN # 6836-50-9795
Address	1125 Highland Avenue
Type of Request	Special use rezoning from GO-L to RMU-S
Proposal	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from GO-L (General Office – special use limited – Offices; Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood; Church or Religious Institution, Community; Child Day Care Center; Adult Day Care Center; and School, Vocational or Professional) to RMU-S (Residential, Multifamily – unrestricted density – special use zoning). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Single Family; and Planned Residential Development
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	<p>According to the petitioner: “A neighborhood meeting was held at 6:30 pm on Tuesday February 28, 2017 at the Rupert Bell Neighborhood Center which is located at 1501 Mount Zion Place. Twenty-six (26) people signed in and a few more individuals attended but did not sign in. Attendees were able to view multiple boards displaying the site plan, floor plans, and rendered elevations. Questions presented included the size of the units, the number of floors, the inclusion of meeting and activity space for residents, eligibility criteria, and security. The prevailing takeaway was twofold: (i) attendees desire that a barrier (other than a landscape border) be added on the east side of the project-site; and (ii) attendees were eager to expedite demolition as they consider the burned remains of the former school an eyesore in the community.”</p>
Zoning District Purpose Statement	<p>The RMU District is primarily intended to accommodate multifamily uses at unrestricted densities. This district is appropriate for GMAs 1 and 2 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental services, are available and the site has direct access to a minor or major thoroughfare.</p>
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	<p>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?</p>
	<p>Yes, the request is for a multifamily residential development at a density of approximately 26.8 units per acre. The site is located within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA 2 and while it does not have direct access onto a minor or major thoroughfare, the site does front onto two</p>

	collector streets and Cleveland Avenue (which is classified as a minor thoroughfare) is located approximately 200 feet to the east.			
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION				
Location	East side of Highland Avenue, between Eleventh Street and Twelfth Street			
Jurisdiction	City of Winston-Salem			
Ward(s)	East			
Site Acreage	± 4.47 acres			
Current Land Use	The site was the former location of Brown Elementary School; however, the historic school was damaged by fire on December 20, 2016.			
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use	
	North	RS9	Single family homes	
	East	RM18	Multifamily residential	
	South	RM18	Institutional (Best Choice Center/YWCA)	
	West	RS9 & GO-L	Church and institutional parking	
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?			
	Yes, the proposed multifamily residential use is compatible with the residential and institutional uses permitted on the surrounding properties.			
Physical Characteristics	The developed site has a gentle slope downward toward the northeast.			
Proximity to Water and Sewer	Public water and sewer are available to the site.			
Stormwater/ Drainage	The site plan shows a stormwater management facility to be located in the northeastern corner of the site. A stormwater study will be required.			
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.			
Analysis of General Site Information	Currently located on the site are the remains of the former Brown Elementary School which was largely damaged by fire in 2016. The site is also traversed by a public water line which will have to be abandoned and removed prior to any construction on the site. The site has no apparent natural constraints such steep slopes, water supply watersheds, or designated floodplains.			
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION				
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D
Highland Avenue	Collector Street	450'	NA	NA
Eleventh Street	Local Street	402'	NA	NA
Twelfth Street	Collector Street	464'	NA	NA

Proposed Access Point(s)	The vehicular access to the site will be from Twelfth Street opposite of the intersection with Dublin Drive.
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	<p><u>Existing Zoning: GO-L</u> Staff is unable to provide an accurate trip generation for the existing special use limited zoning because there is no site plan.</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: RMU-S</u> 120 units x 6.65 (Apartment Trip Rate) = 798 Trips per Day</p>
Sidewalks	Sidewalks are located along both sides of all the abutting streets. The site plan includes multiple lateral connections from the proposed building to said public sidewalks.
Transit	Routes 93 and 98 run along Highland Avenue.
Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information	The site has excellent access having frontage along three public streets. The general area is characterized by a well-connected network of streets and the site is also well served with transit and a network of sidewalks.
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES	
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 2 – Urban neighborhoods
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encourage higher development densities and mixed-use development within the serviceable land area. • Facilitate land use patterns that offer a variety of housing choices. • Promote quality design so that infill does not negatively impact surrounding development. • Revitalization efforts have also been accomplished in a number of urban neighborhoods through redevelopment, residential and commercial infill and targeted rehabilitation of residential areas and structures.
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>East-Northeast Area Plan Update (2015)</i>
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed land use for the subject property is mixed use. • The site is part of the Cleveland Avenue Initiative Master Plan which recommends: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Continue creating a pedestrian-friendly, mixed use and mixed-income housing that is integrated with the existing neighborhoods. New development should include low-rise units for elderly housing, public housing, market-rate housing for home-ownership, and economic development business activities in a traditional neighborhood setting.
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is not located along a growth corridor.
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is not located within an activity center.

Addressing	Floor plans and building elevations must be submitted prior to addresses being issued.
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	See comments below.
	(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?
	Yes
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	<p>The request is to rezone the 4.47 acre property from GO-L to RMU-S in order to construct a four story multifamily residential building with a total of 120 units. The subject property was historically the site of Brown Elementary School which has been vacated for several years. The <i>East-Northeast Area Plan Update</i> recommends mixed use development for the site along with the other properties in the general area.</p> <p>Planning staff sees the subject property as a suitable location for multifamily residential which is a vital ingredient for mixed use development. The well connected network of streets, access to transit and sidewalks, and the proximity to various institutional uses, would complement new residential development on this site.</p> <p>Two other multifamily redevelopment projects have been recently completed within ±300' of the subject property. Camden Station, located at the corner of Cleveland Avenue and Twelfth Street (W-3185) and The Oaks at Tenth located at the corner of Cleveland Avenue and Tenth Street (W-3043) established a precedent for RMU zoning in this area and also for quality design and architecture. The petitioners have submitted attractive building elevations which staff believes will continue the same level of enhancement to the streetscape in this area (see Exhibit A).</p> <p>As noted previously, the land use across Twelfth Street at the northern edge of the site, is used for single family homes. From a building mass and scale perspective, staff had concerns of what the potentially negative impacts would be on these homes from having a four story building constructed across the street from them. However, the petitioner has pulled the proposed four story building back more than 80' from the right-of-way of Twelfth Street and the parking area is also setback back an equal distance from Twelfth Street. Staff commends the applicant for providing a building placement that allows for an adequate transition adjacent to the existing single family homes. Staff recommends approval of the request.</p>

RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3185	RM18 to RMU-S	Approved 7-1-2013	300' northeast	1.31	Approval	Approval
W-3043	RM18 to RMU-L	Approved 9-8-2009	300' southeast	2.57	Approval	Approval
W-3037	RM12-S to GO-L	Approved 7-6-2009	Included the current site	5.17	Approval	Approval
SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS						
Building Square Footage	Square Footage		Placement on Site			
	141,300 square feet		Pulled up to the corner of Highland Avenue and Eleventh Street			
Units (by type) and Density	120 apartment units on 4.47 acres = 26.8 dwelling units per acre.					
Parking	Required			Proposed		
	90 spaces			120 spaces		
Building Height	Maximum			Proposed		
	NA			4 Stories		
Impervious Coverage	Maximum			Proposed		
	85%			54.9 %		
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (O) RMU District Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Multifamily Use Conditions 					
Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3	(A) <i>Legacy 2030</i> policies:		Yes			
	(B) <i>Environmental Ord.</i>		NA			
	(C) <i>Subdivision Regulations</i>		NA			
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	The site plan illustrates one, four story multifamily building and associated parking to be constructed on the site. The parking would be located internally to the site and the building would be pulled up to the corner of Highland Avenue and Eleventh Street with an entrance at said corner. This design would be in compliance with the orientation requirement (primary entrances facing the street) for multifamily buildings within the Urban Neighborhoods Growth Management Area. The site plan complies with the requirements of the UDO.					
CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION						
Positive Aspects of Proposal			Negative Aspects of Proposal			
The request is consistent with the recommendations of <i>Legacy 2030</i> and the <i>East-Northeast Area Plan Update</i> .			The request may add some additional traffic to the area.			
The request is consistent with the purpose statement of the proposed RMU-S district.						

The proposed building placement and elevations will enhance the streetscapes of the adjacent public streets.	
There are two other multifamily residential developments located in close proximity to the subject property which were developed under RMU-L and RMU-S zoning.	
SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL	
The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:</u><ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Developer shall obtain all necessary permits from the NC Department of Environmental Quality – Division of Energy, Mineral, and Land Resources (NCDEQ-DEMLR).b. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.c. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department.• <u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:</u><ul style="list-style-type: none">a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Exhibit A” as verified by Planning staff.• <u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:</u><ul style="list-style-type: none">a. All required improvements of the City of Winston-Salem driveway permit shall be completed.b. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-3324
MARCH 9, 2017**

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

Neighbors requested a barrier at the east side of the building. It was incorporated into this design.

The site is part of the *Cleveland Avenue Initiative Master Plan*.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the zoning petition and certified that the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all code requirements if the petition is approved.

SECOND: Paul Mullican

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning and Development Services