

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION			
Docket	W-3542		
Staff	Marc Allred		
Petitioner(s)	Brookstown Development Partners LLC		
Owner(s)	Same		
Subject Property	PINs 6825-95-0940, 6825-95-2732, 6825-95-2515,6825-95-0565, 6825-95-0608, and 6825-95-9752		
Address	932 and 920 Brookstown Avenue; 101, 115, and 121 Fayette Street		
Type of Request	Site Plan Amendment		
Proposal	The petitioner proposes to amend the previously approved site plan for Zoning Docket W-2936, to add an additional story to the building. The added story would include 66 apartments and additional parking.		
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.		
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION			
Location	Southwest corner of West Second Street and Brookstown Avenue		
Jurisdiction	Winston-Salem		
Ward(s)	Northwest		
Site Acreage	± 4.16 acres		
Current Land Use	The site is currently comprised of multiple modest-sized commercial buildings, surface parking, and some vacant parcels.		
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use
	North	PB	Multi-family residential and commercial
	East	PB-S	Multi-family residential
	South	PB-S	Multi-family residential and office
	West	PB	Commercial
Physical Characteristics	The site generally slopes downward from the intersection of Brookstown Avenue and Second Street toward Fayette Street at the southwest.		
Proximity to Water and Sewer	The site is served by multiple water and sewer lines within the surrounding street rights-of-way.		
Stormwater/ Drainage	This development is exempt from the City of Winston-Salem’s Post Construction Stormwater Management Ordinance because it is included within a prior stormwater management master plan for the entire ballpark development (approved in 2008).		
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.		
Historic, Natural Heritage and/or	Brookstown Avenue follows the general route of an 18 th century road that connected Salem to the northwestern parts of Forsyth County.		

Farmland Inventories		The name of the road has changed over several centuries, and maps label it as Fries Old Plank Road among other variations.				
Analysis of General Site Information		The site is located within an urban, mixed-use setting and is bounded on all sides by public streets. The northern portion of the site contains surface parking and one-story commercial buildings. The southern portion of the site is undeveloped. The site has generally favorable topography and good views of Downtown Winston-Salem and Truist Ballpark.				
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-2936	PB-S (Two Phase) Final Development Plan	Approved 5/2/2022	Subject Property	4.16	Approval	Approval
W-2936	PB-S (Two Phase) Final Development Plan	Approved 11/4/2019	Directly east	4.4	Approval	Approval
W-3139	PB-S (Two Phase) Final Development Plan	Approved 4/2/2012	Directly south	2.76	Approval	Approval
W-2936	RSQ, LO, PB, HB, LB-S, & PB-S to PB-S (Two Phase)	Approved 8/6/2007	Included subject property	28.35	Approval	Approval
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION						
Street Name		Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D	
West First Street		Major Thoroughfare	306 feet	5,700	15,800	
West Second Street		Boulevard	375 feet	6,600	15,800	
Brookstown Avenue		Collector Street	450 feet	N/A	N/A	
Fayette Street		Local Street	305 feet	N/A	N/A	
Proposed Access Point(s)		The site will have access off Fayette Street.				
Proposed Road Improvements		The developer shall install a right turn lane at the intersection of First Street and Fayette Street with 50 feet of storage and an appropriate design taper. Additionally, the radius for the new curb line must be 30 feet. WSDOT is working on the two-way conversion of First and Second Street, which the property directly fronts on. The site plan is already				

	showing these improvements and the project should be completed by the end of 2022.	
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	According to the Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA), the estimated trip generation from the proposed development would be 2,287 trips over a 24-hour day (see additional comments in the TIA section below).	
Sidewalks	Sidewalks currently exist along all adjacent street frontages, except for the majority of West Second Street. The developer has agreed to replace and widen the sidewalks bordering the site consistent with other developments in the area.	
Transit	WSTA Routes 80, 83, 95 and 103 serve the subject property along West First Street and West Second Street.	
Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)	<p>The proposed development is located on the west side of Second Street between First Street and Brookstown Avenue. The TIA anticipates 345 apartments and a parking deck adjacent to Second Street. One site access to the parking deck on Fayette Street is proposed. The site access is 150 feet north of First Street, measured center-to-center.</p> <p>All intersections should have a level of service D or greater upon completion of the WSDOT Downtown Two-Way Street Conversion project. A wide turning radius at the intersection of First Street and Fayette Street will be provided by the developer. With these improvements, the proposed site is not expected to have a detrimental effect on transportation capacity and mobility in the study area.</p>	
Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information	<p>The entire perimeter of the site is bordered by multi-lane streets with ample capacity. The subject property is also well served by WSTA transit lines and an extensive sidewalk network.</p> <p>Access to parking for the development will be from Fayette Street. With the recommended improvements and the scheduled two-way conversion of West First Street and West Second Street, this development should not have a significant impact on the adjacent transportation network.</p>	
SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS		
Building Square Footage	Square Footage	Placement on Site
	469,310	Entire site

Units (by type) and Density	345 apartment units on 4.16 acres = 82.93 units per acre.		
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout
	385 spaces	544 spaces	90-degree parking in the parking deck. Parallel parking on the street.
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed
	N/A		64 feet
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed
	N/A		73.56 %
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 4.6.6: Pedestrian Business District• 4.8.5: Additional Dimensional Requirements by Use Type in the Nonresidential Districts		
Complies with Section 3.2.11	(A) Legacy 2030 policies:	Yes	
	(B) Environmental Ord.	No	
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	No	
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	The proposed site plan consists of a six-story multifamily residential building surrounding a six-level parking deck. Also included are multiple courtyards, including a pool courtyard along the West Second Street frontage. These areas are also used to meet the required common recreation area calculation for multifamily development.		
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES			
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 2 – Urban Neighborhoods		
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Encourage higher residential densities along growth corridors to create the critical mass for transit to be viable.• Encourage both residential and nonresidential infill development/redevelopment instead of Greenfield development.• Decked parking Downtown should be encouraged. Parking decks that contain multiple levels are more efficient than surface parking where land costs are high.		
Relevant Area Plan(s)	South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan Update (2014)		
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The revitalization of older/underutilized commercial and industrial sites and buildings is to be encouraged.		

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The subject site is part of the Special Land Use Condition Area “Ballpark Area”. The area is supposed to be well-designed, pedestrian friendly, mixed-use urban development that would serve to “anchor” the western edge of Downtown. The portion of Second Street adjacent to the subject property is identified as a potential streetcar route.
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	Yes, a portion of the site is located on the Second Street/Country Club Road Growth Corridor.
Site Located within Activity Center?	No.
Addressing	111 Fayette Street
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	<p>The proposed site plan amendment would add one story to the proposed building, for a total of six floors. The additional level would include 66 apartment units and additional parking. This amendment also removes site access from Brookstown Avenue. A Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA) was required and found that one access point off Fayette Street was sufficient.</p> <p>The cost of housing has skyrocketed in recent years, partially due to the supply and demand imbalance in the market. Real estate is not being built fast enough to meet supply, leaving only a small amount of available housing units for new residents.</p> <p>High density development can be a solution to this problem, and the area around Truist Stadium is appropriate for this type of development. As this site area has significant changes in elevation, an additional sixth floor of building area here will be compatible with the scale of other development in the area.</p> <p>This site plan amendment complies with <i>Legacy</i> and <i>South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan</i> recommendations for redevelopment and high-density development that is compatible with the rest of the area.</p>
CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION	
Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
The site is a good location for high-density residential development because it is served by multiple transit routes and is within the Urban Neighborhoods Growth Management Area (GMA 2).	The request will increase traffic in the general area.
The request helps satisfy demand for housing near Downtown Winston-Salem.	
The proposed development is adjacent to other urban multifamily developments.	

SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following conditions are proposed from interdepartmental review comments to meet established standards or to reduce negative off-site impacts:

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
 - a. The developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem. Required improvements include:
 - Dedication of right-of-way to the specifications of WSDOT;
 - Closure of all unused curb cuts with similar materials;
 - Removal of any existing streetlights at WSDOT's request;
 - Replace/Upgrade any pedestrian pedestal as required by WSDOT;
 - All improvements recommended by the approved TIA;
 - Installation of all public sidewalks as shown on the site plan; and
 - Installation of ADA detectable dome mats at all intersections where they are not currently present.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
 - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE(S) OF OCCUPANCY:**
 - a. All required improvements of the driveway permit shall be completed.
 - b. Any damage to City-maintained streets, sidewalk, or curb shall be replaced or repaired to the requirements of the Public Works Department.
 - c. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.
 - d. All street trees shall be installed as shown on the site plan.
 - e. All improvements to First Street must be completed to WSDOT standards.
- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
 - a. The use Services, A shall be further restricted not to allow tattoo parlors.
 - b. No freestanding signage shall be permitted.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; the City-County Planning Board makes final recommendations, and final action is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, which may approve, deny, continue, or request modification to any request. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES FOR W-3542 AUGUST 11, 2022

David Reed presented the staff report.

George Bryan asked what exactly is changing with this request - is it just adding another story with parking to the approved development? David Reed confirmed this was the case. David also noted that the second access point on Brookstown Avenue was being removed. George stated that he wished all new mixed-use buildings Downtown would go up ten stories as this is very efficient and environmentally responsible.

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended that the Planning Board find that the request is consistent with the comprehensive plan.

SECOND: Mo McRae

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Mo McRae, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the ordinance amendment.

SECOND: Mo McRae

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Mo McRae, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Chris Murphy, AICP/CZO
Director of Planning and Development Services