

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION			
Docket #	W-2936		
Staff	Tiffany White		
Petitioner(s)	DPJ Residential, LLC		
Owner(s)	Same		
Subject Property	PINs 6825-95-0940, 6825-95-2732, 6825-95-2515, 6825-95-0565, 6825-95-0608, and 6825-95-9752		
Address	932 and 920 Brookstown Avenue; 101, 115, and 121 Fayette Street		
Type of Request	Final Development Plan and Master Plan Amendment for a 279-unit multifamily development in a PB-S (Two Phase) zoning district		
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.		
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION			
Location	Southwest corner of West Second Street and Brookstown Avenue		
Jurisdiction	Winston-Salem		
Ward(s)	Northwest		
Site Acreage	± 4.16 acres		
Current Land Use	The site is developed with multiple modest-sized commercial buildings, some surface parking areas, and some vacant parcels.		
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use
	North	PB	Apartments and some commercial buildings
	East	PB-S	Apartments (under construction)
	South	PB-S	Apartments and an office building
	West	PB	Several modest-sized commercial buildings
Physical Characteristics	The site generally slopes downward from the intersection of Brookstown Avenue and Second Street toward Fayette Street in the southwest.		
Proximity to Water and Sewer	The site is served by multiple water and sewer lines within the surrounding street rights-of-way.		
Stormwater/ Drainage	This development is exempt from the City of Winston-Salem’s Post Construction Stormwater Management Ordinance because it is included within a prior stormwater management master plan for the entire ballpark development approved in 2008.		
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.		

Historic, Natural Heritage and/or Farmland Inventories	Brookstown Avenue follows the general route of an 18 th Century road that connected Salem to the northwestern parts of Forsyth County. The name of the road has changed over several centuries, and maps label it as Baumgarten Weg, Fries Old Plank Road, and New Shallowford, among other variations.
Analysis of General Site Information	The site is located within an urban, mixed-use setting and is bounded on all sides by public streets. The northern portion of the site contains surface parking areas and one-story commercial buildings. The southern portion of the site is undeveloped. The site has generally favorable topography and good views of downtown Winston-Salem and the BB&T Ballpark.

RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES

Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-2936	PB-S (Two Phase) Final Development Plan	Approved 11/4/2019	Directly east	4.4	Approval	Approval
W-3139	PB-S (Two Phase) Site Plan Amendment and Final Development Plan	Approved 4/2/2012	Directly south	2.76	Approval	Approval
W-2936	RSQ, LO, PB, HB, LB-S, & PB-S to PB-S (Two Phase)	Approved 8/6/2007	Included subject property	28.35	Approval	Approval

SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D
West First Street	Major Thoroughfare	306 feet	5,700	15,800
West Second Street	Boulevard	375 feet	6,600	15,800
Brookstown Avenue	Collector Street	450 feet	N/A	N/A
Fayette Street	Local Street	305 feet	N/A	N/A

Proposed Access Point(s)	The site will have access from Brookstown Avenue and Fayette Street.
Planned Road Improvements	The City of Winston-Salem (in conjunction with the Winston-Salem Chamber of Commerce Business 40 Task Force and the recommendations of the Downtown Street Study) plans to convert many Downtown one-way street segments into two-way streets. Design plans to convert the sections of West First Street and West Second Street adjacent to the subject property are in the final stages.
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	According to the Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA), the estimated trip generation from the proposed development would be 1,864 trips over a 24- hour day (see additional comments in the TIA section below).
Sidewalks	Sidewalks currently exist along all adjacent street frontages, except for the majority of West Second Street. The developer has agreed to replace and widen the sidewalks bordering the site consistent with other developments in the area.
Transit	WSTA Routes 80, 83, 95 and 103 serve the subject property along West First Street and West Second Street.
Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)	<p>The proposed site plan shows two accesses to an internal parking deck: one access from Brookstown Avenue and one from Fayette Street. The first access is approximately 225 feet, measured center-to-center, west of West Second Street on Brookstown Avenue. The second access is approximately 150 feet north of West First Street on Fayette Street. WSDOT will review the final interior parking deck design. WSDOT is requiring the developer to install a tapered 100-foot slip lane on West First Street for right-turning traffic onto Fayette Street, as well as a one-year, \$50,000 safety bond (to start once Certificates of Occupancy are issued). The safety bond will cover improvements if an accident problem is created by the new site traffic, particularly from left turn movements onto Fayette Street and Brookstown Avenue.</p> <p>The TIA estimated the trip generation from the proposed development to be 1,864 trips over a 24-hour day. This resulted in a PM peak hour trip generation of 141. It should be noted that the peak hour and 24-hour trip generation numbers represent two-way trips. For example, leaving the building in the morning and returning in the evening count as two separate trips.</p> <p>The Level of Service (LOS) was analyzed to ensure adequate capacity and minimal delay could be expected with the proposed development. Currently, WSDOT has a contract to design portions of West First Street and West Second Street with a two-way configuration. This was known by the TIA consultant and incorporated into their analysis. All intersections within the study area limits are expected to operate at a satisfactory LOS, with the understanding that the sections of these two streets adjoining the subject property will be reconfigured to allow for two-way traffic. The table below represents the LOS results for the proposed development:</p>

Table 5 - Level of Service Summary		
AM Peak	2024 Future No Build	2024 Future Build
Broad Street at Second Street	B (16.5)	B (16.5)
First Street at Peters Creek Parkway/Second Street	C (28.9)	C (30.7)
Broad Street at First Street	C (34.9)	D (37.9)
Second Street at Brookstown Avenue	C (23.7) EB Approach	C (24.2) EB Approach
First Street at Fayette Street	B (11.1) SB Approach	B (11.8) SB Approach
Burke Street at Brookstown Avenue	B (10.4)	B (10.5)
Brookstown Avenue at Site Access 1		A (9.1) NB Approach
Fayette Street at Site Access 2		A (9.2) WB Approach
PM Peak	2024 Future No Build	2024 Future Build
Broad Street at Second Street	B (13.5)	B (13.5)
First Street at Peters Creek Parkway/Second Street	C (33.8)	D (35.2)
Broad Street at First Street	C (21.1)	C (21.5)
Second Street at Brookstown Avenue	D (29.9) EB Approach	D (32.9) EB Approach
First Street at Fayette Street	B (11.3) SB Approach	B (12.2) SB Approach
Burke Street at Brookstown Avenue	A (8.6)	A (8.7)
Brookstown Avenue at Site Access 1		A (9.2) NB Approach
Fayette Street at Site Access 2		A (9.4) WB Approach
LOS (delay in seconds) Note for unsignalized conditions, LOS and delay indicates only minor street approach with longest delay		

With the improvements associated with Downtown Two-Way Street Conversion, the proposed site is not expected to have a detrimental effect on transportation capacity and mobility in the study area. The subject property is also well served by transit lines and an extensive sidewalk network.

Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information

The entire perimeter of the site is bordered by multi-lane streets with ample capacity. The subject property is also well served by WSTA transit lines and an extensive sidewalk network.

Access to the development will be from Brookstown Avenue and Fayette Street. With the recommended improvements and the scheduled two-way conversion of West First Street and West Second Street, this development should not have a significant impact on the adjacent transportation network.

SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS			
Building Square Footage	Square Footage		Placement on Site
	469,310		Primarily located on the entire site
Units (by type) and Density	279 apartment units on 4.2 acres = 67 dwelling units per acre		
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout
	314 spaces	412 spaces	Located within a five-story parking deck
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed
	60 feet		Five stories
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed
	N/A		66.11 percent
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Section 4.6.6: Pedestrian Business District • Section 5.2.71: Residential Building, Multifamily (use-specific standards) 		
Complies with Section 3.2.11	(A) Legacy 2030 policies:	Yes	
	(B) Environmental Ordinance	N/A	
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	N/A	
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	The proposed site plan consists of a five-story multifamily residential building surrounding a five-level parking deck. Also included are multiple courtyards, including a pool courtyard along the West Second Street frontage. These areas are also used to meet the required common recreation area calculation for multifamily development.		
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES			
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 2 – Urban Neighborhoods		
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promote quality design so that infill does not negatively impact surrounding development. • Facilitate land use patterns that offer a variety of housing choices. • Encourage reuse of vacant and underutilized commercial and industrial sites. • Promote a pedestrian-friendly orientation for new development and redevelopment and reduce the visual dominance of parking areas. 		
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan Update (2014)</i>		
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The subject property is within a Special Land Use Conditions area; the area plan recommends mixed-use development. • The revitalization of older/underutilized commercial and industrial sites and buildings is to be encouraged. 		
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is not located along a growth corridor.		
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is not located within an activity center.		

<p>Other Applicable Plans and Planning Issues</p>	<p>In 2007, when the entire PB-S (Two Phase) site was rezoned, one of the conditions required the developer to submit a Master Plan for the second phase prior to the approval of any Final Development Plan. The condition stated, “The Master Plan should include proposed building locations/placements, proposed land uses, parking areas, and should incorporate the elements of an urban mixed-use project. The approval authority for the Master Plan shall be the City Council.” Phase One only included the development of BB&T Ballpark. The remaining parcels of the two-phase site plan were left blank with the intent of having market demand(s) dictate the buildout time frame. However, at that time, the developer introduced some renderings to show the intent to develop the remaining parcels in a well-designed, pedestrian-friendly, mixed-use urban development that would serve to “anchor” the western edge of Downtown.</p> <p>In 2016, a Final Development Plan for the 5.3-acre site diagonally south across West First Street was approved. This request included a mixture of uses, including a hotel, anchor retail, and five stories of residential surrounding a six-level parking deck. To date, no permits have been issued for this project. In conjunction with this Final Development Plan, a Master Plan was approved by the City Council. This plan illustrated approximately 57,000 square feet of retail space on the subject property, including a grocery store. In 2019, a Final Development Plan for the 4.4-acre site located directly across Second Street was approved for multifamily housing and a publicly accessed park.</p> <p>The following criteria were used in evaluating the initial Master Plan and the proposed amendment: the above wording of the approved condition; the location of approximately half of the area being located within the City Center Growth Management Area (GMA 1); the recommendations of the <i>South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan Update</i>; and the purpose statement and requirements of the PB zoning district.</p> <p>For the subject property, the <i>proposed</i> Master Plan shows the multifamily residential building included in the current request. Staff commends the use of structured parking and the removal of surface parking areas which were shown on the approved Master Plan. Staff recognizes the long-term, speculative nature of such a master plan and the difficulty in predicting which particular land use or tenant mix may occur over time.</p>
<p>Addressing</p>	<p>Addresses will be assigned when building floor plans are submitted.</p>

Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	Yes. The West End Station apartments directly north of the site have recently been completed, and in 2019, a Final Development Plan for the site directly east across West Second Street was approved, with apartments currently under construction.
	(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?
	Yes
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	<p>The site is part of a larger PB-S (Two Phase) site that was rezoned in 2007. This rezoning included multiple blocks on the western edge of Downtown and showed the first phase of the BB&T Ballpark. In 2012, a Site Plan Amendment was approved by City Council, which allowed the construction of the Link Apartments. In 2016, a Final Development Plan for the site across West First Street was approved, along with the Master Plan. In 2019, a Final Development Plan for the site located across West Second Street was approved, along with the Master Plan. The current request represents the next phase of development for the overall PB-S Two Phase area.</p> <p>The site is in the Urban Neighborhoods Growth Management Area (GMA 2), where increased residential densities and mixed-use, pedestrian-oriented development are encouraged. The <i>South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan Update</i> similarly recommends an urban, mixed-use project for the subject property that would complement the ballpark and be consistent with the original design concept. The site is also served by multiple transit lines and is located along the Peters Creek Parkway/West Second Street Corridor where higher residential densities are encouraged.</p> <p>The proposed site plan and revised building elevations comply with the recommendations of both <i>Legacy 2030</i> and the area plan. The request is consistent with the requirements of the PB district regarding building placement, orientation, and pedestrian-oriented architectural features. The purpose statement for the PB district identifies several important streetscape details, such as “wide sidewalks, street trees, and on-street parking,” all of which help to achieve a vibrant, walkable experience for the pedestrian. Considering the site’s location within GMA 2 and the current and anticipated levels of foot traffic within the general area, staff recommends that great care be taken along the three street frontages of this proposed development. The end result should be a careful and seamless blending of the public and private realms.</p> <p>The site is positioned as part of a gateway property into Downtown, especially the West Second Street frontage. The parking deck entrances will be located on adjacent streets, limiting the traffic disruption along West Second Street. The proposed streetscape within the public right-of-way includes replacing the existing sidewalks with larger ones to match</p>

adjacent developments. On-street parking is proposed along Brookstown Avenue and Fayette Street. Along West First Street and West Second Street, large variety canopy trees will be located within four-foot by eight-foot tree wells within the sidewalk. Additional street trees will be included along Fayette Street and Brookstown Avenue.

Staff is supportive of the Master Plan and the Final Development Plan. However, for the overall development to remain consistent with the intent for an “urban mixed-use project,” future installations within the master plan area will need to include nonresidential components.

NOTE: Procedurally, both the Final Development Plan and the Master Plan Amendment require final approval from the Winston-Salem City Council.

CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
The site is a good location for high-density residential development because it is served by multiple transit routes, is within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA, and is not adjacent to a single-family residential area.	The request does not include a mixture of uses.
The request represents a significant addition to the tax base on an underutilized site with access to several urban services.	The request will increase traffic in the general area.
The proposed development is adjacent to other urban multifamily developments.	
The request would provide a significant improvement to the urban streetscape at a critical location.	

SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

Note: The conditions listed below are only applicable to the subject property of this request and its Final Development Plan. All conditions previously approved by the City Council remain in effect for the remainder of the PB-S (Two Phase) zoning (W-2936).

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF ANY PERMITS:**
 - a. Prior to approval of the Final Development Plan by the City Council, the City Council shall approve a master plan for the remaining second phase of the overall PB-S (Two Phase) development. The master plan should include proposed building locations/placements, proposed land uses, and parking areas and should incorporate the elements of an urban mixed-use project.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
 - a. The developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem. Required improvements include:
 - Dedication of right-of-way to the specifications of WSDOT;
 - Closure of all unused curb cuts with similar materials;
 - All improvements recommended by the approved TIA;
 - Installation of all public sidewalks as shown on the site plan; and
 - Installation of ADA detectable dome mats at all intersections where they are not currently present.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
 - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.
 - b. The developer shall demonstrate that the 1,026 parking spaces required for the ballpark are reserved for that purpose in substantial conformity with the approved parking study. Any parking lease agreements used to satisfy this requirement shall be in conformance with UDO requirements.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
 - a. All required improvements of the driveway permit shall be completed.
 - b. Any damage to City-maintained streets, sidewalk, or curb shall be replaced or repaired to the requirements of the Public Works Department.
 - c. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.
 - d. All street trees shall be installed as shown on the site plan.

- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
 - a. The use Services, A shall be further restricted not to allow tattoo parlors.
 - b. No freestanding signage shall be permitted.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THE AMENDED MASTER PLAN: Approval

STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR THE FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, which may approve, deny, table, or request modification to any request. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-2936
April 14, 2022**

Desmond Corley presented the staff report, during which George Bryan asked for clarification regarding the submitted Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA), and Melynda Dunigan asked to be shown where opportunities for nonresidential development remained in the master plan area.

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the Final Development Plan.

SECOND: Walter Farabee

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Walter Farabee, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak,
Brenda Smith

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Chris Murphy, AICP/CZO
Director of Planning and Development Services