

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
STAFF REPORT**

<b>PETITION INFORMATION</b>	
<b>Docket</b>	W-3449
<b>Staff</b>	<a href="#">Gary Roberts, Jr., AICP</a>
<b>Petitioner(s)</b>	White Oak Vista, LLC
<b>Owner(s)</b>	Same
<b>Subject Property</b>	PINs 6815-14-1462 and 6815-14-3306
<b>Address</b>	3831 and 3901 Country Club Road
<b>Type of Request</b>	Special Use rezoning from LB-L to GB-S
<b>Proposal</b>	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Map for the subject property <b>from</b> LB-L (Limited Business – Special Use Limited - Arts and Crafts Studio; Food or Drug Store; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Restaurant (without drive-through service); Retail Store; Banking and Financial Services; Offices; Services A; Recreational Services, Indoor; Child Care, Drop-In; Church or Religious Institution, Community; Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; Limited Campus Uses; Museum or Art Gallery; and Access Easement, Private Off-Site) <b>to</b> GB-S (General Business – Special Use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Arts and Crafts Studio; Banking and Financial Services; Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood; Club or Lodge; Combined Use; Food or Drug Store; Funeral Home; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; Institutional Vocational Training Facility; Library, Public; Micro-Brewery or Micro-Distillery; Museum or Art Gallery; Nursery, Lawn and Garden Supply Store, Retail; Offices; Police or Fire Station; Recreation Facility, Public; Recreation Services, Indoor; Recreation Services, Outdoor; Restaurant (without drive-through service); Retail Store; School, Vocational or Professional; Services, A; Shopping Center, Small; Special Events Center; Storage Services, Retail; Swimming Pool, Private; Testing and Research Lab; Theater, Indoor; Urban Agriculture; Utilities; Veterinary Services; Warehousing; Wholesale Trade A; Adult Day Care Center; Child Care Institution; Child Care, Sick Children; and Child Day Care Center</li> </ul>
<b>Neighborhood Contact/Meeting</b>	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.

<b>Zoning District Purpose Statement</b>	The GB District is primarily intended to accommodate a wide range of retail, service, and office uses located along thoroughfares in areas which have developed with minimal front setbacks. However, the district is not intended to encourage or accommodate strip commercial development. The district would accommodate destination retail and service uses, characterized by either a larger single business use or the consolidation of numerous uses within a building or planned development, with consolidated access. This district is intended for application in Growth Management Areas (GMA) 1, 2, 3, and Metro Activity Centers.		
<b>Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.15 A 13</b>	<b>Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?</b>		
	The site is located within GMA 3 (Suburban Neighborhoods) along a major thoroughfare. The request should not encourage strip commercial development.		
<b>GENERAL SITE INFORMATION</b>			
<b>Location</b>	North side of Country Club Road, across from Tucker Avenue		
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	Winston-Salem		
<b>Ward(s)</b>	West		
<b>Site Acreage</b>	± 1.91 acres		
<b>Current Land Use</b>	The site is developed with a 1,118-square foot office building and a 1,962-square foot retail building with associated parking.		
<b>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</b>	<b>Direction</b>	<b>Zoning District</b>	<b>Use</b>
	North	RS9	Single-family homes (Gordon Manor neighborhood)
	East	RS9	Trinity United Methodist Church
	South	RM5 and LB	Single-family homes and various businesses
	West	RS9, LB and HB-S	Small shopping center
<b>Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.15 A 13</b>	<b>Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?</b>		
	The proposed commercial and institutional uses are compatible with the uses permitted on the adjacent LB and HB-S properties. These uses are less compatible with the low-density residential uses permitted on the adjacent RS9 properties.		
<b>Physical Characteristics</b>	The partially developed site has a gentle slope downward toward the northeast. The majority of the site to the rear of the existing buildings is wooded. Additionally, the site contains a large white oak tree, which was measured by the Treasure Tree of Forsyth County Committee and found to be one of the oldest and largest trees in Forsyth County.		
<b>Proximity to Water and Sewer</b>	Public water and sewer lines are located beneath Country Club Road.		
<b>Stormwater/ Drainage</b>	The proposed site plan shows a stormwater management facility in the northern portion of the site. A stormwater management study will be required.		

<b>Watershed and Overlay Districts</b>	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.					
<b>Analysis of General Site Information</b>	The site is slightly under two acres in size and contains two modest buildings. The site has favorable topography and a significant amount of existing mature trees. Among the vegetation on the site is a large white oak tree that was conditioned for preservation during the most recent LB-L rezoning of the site.					
<b>RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES</b>						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3248	LB, LB-S, and RS9 to LB-L	Approved 3/2/2015	Subject property	2.02	Approval	Approval
W-1897	R4 to B3-S (LB-S)	Approved 5/2/1994	Included a portion of subject property	1.22	Approval	Approval
<b>SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION</b>						
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D		
Country Club Road	Major Thoroughfare	282 feet	16,000	15,800		
<b>Proposed Access Point(s)</b>	The site will use a new access from Country Club Road at the eastern end of the site.					
<b>Planned Road Improvements</b>	The <i>Comprehensive Transportation Plan</i> recommends a three-lane cross section for Country Club Road, with wide outside lanes and sidewalks on both sides.					
<b>Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed</b>	<p><u>Existing Zoning: LB-L</u> Staff is unable to estimate trip generation for the existing zoning because the existing buildings are no longer in use.</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: GB-S</u> 87,200 sf / 1,000 x 2.5 (mini-warehouse trip rate) = 218 trips per day</p>					
<b>Sidewalks</b>	Sidewalk currently exists along a portion of the site's frontage and will be provided along the entire frontage.					
<b>Transit</b>	WSTA Route 95 serves the subject property along Country Club Road.					
<b>Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)</b>	A TIA is not required.					
<b>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</b>	The subject property is located along Country Club Road, a major thoroughfare along a transit route. The proposed site plan is designed for a use that is expected to generate few trips.					
<b>SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS</b>						
Building Square Footage	Square Footage			Placement on Site		
	87,200			Pulled up to Country Club Road		

<b>Parking</b>	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Layout</b>
	4 spaces	12 spaces	90-degree head-in
<b>Building Height</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	60 feet		Two stories
<b>Impervious Coverage</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	N/A		51.31 percent
<b>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Section 4.6.10: General Business District</li> <li>Section 5.2.89: Storage Services, Retail (use-specific standards)</li> </ul>		
<b>Complies with Section 3.2.11</b>	<b>(A) Legacy 2030 policies:</b>	Yes	
	<b>(B) Environmental Ord.</b>	N/A	
	<b>(C) Subdivision Regulations</b>	N/A	
<b>Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements</b>	The proposed site plan shows a two-story self-storage building occupying 87,200 total square feet. The parking and service areas would be in the eastern portion of the site, adjacent to the abutting church parking lot.		
<b>CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES</b>			
<b>Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area</b>	Growth Management Area 3 – Suburban Neighborhoods		
<b>Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ensure appropriate transitional land uses or physical buffering between residential and nonresidential uses to maintain the character and stability of neighborhoods.</li> <li>Consider requiring new buildings to be oriented to both public and internal streets and parking areas located internally on the site or behind buildings.</li> <li>Promote a pedestrian-friendly orientation for new development and redevelopment and reduce the visual dominance of parking areas.</li> </ul>		
<b>Relevant Area Plan(s)</b>	<i>West Suburban Area Plan Update (2018)</i>		
<b>Area Plan Recommendations</b>	<p>The plan identifies this site as being within the Country Club Road Activity Center and recommends Commercial Land Use. New development or redevelopment in this activity center should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Commercial uses located on Country Club Road having a pedestrian-oriented urban form with buildings near the street featuring transparent windows and doors, façade articulation, and parking to the side or rear of buildings.</li> <li>Land uses should be linked to each other and adjoining properties through vehicular and pedestrian connections.</li> <li>Installation of bufferyards, streetyards, and parking area plantings should occur where feasible.</li> <li>Screening of commercial uses abutting residential development is recommended.</li> </ul>		

<b>Site Located Along Growth Corridor?</b>	The site is located along the Country Club Road growth corridor.
<b>Site Located within Activity Center?</b>	The site is located within the Gordon Manor Activity Center.
<b>Addressing</b>	The address will be 3901 Country Club Road.
<b>Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.15 A 13</b>	<b>Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?</b>
	No
	<b>Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?</b>
	Yes
<b>Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues</b>	<p>The request is to rezone a partially developed site from LB-L to GB-S to develop a two-story self-storage facility. The <i>West Suburban Area Plan</i> identifies this site as being within the Gordon Manor Activity Center and recommends commercial land use.</p> <p><i>Legacy</i> recommends pedestrian-friendly building orientation for new development and reducing the visual dominance of parking areas. Although the use specified on the site plan is not one typically recommended within a neighborhood-scale activity center, the proposed building placement and minimal parking area are consistent with this recommendation. There are also other uses included in the request – such as Retail Store, Services, A and Restaurant (without drive-through service) – that <i>are</i> desirable within smaller activity centers.</p> <p>Directly north of the site is the Gordon Manor neighborhood. Consistent with a condition of the previously approved zoning for this site (W-3248), the request carries forward the Type III bufferyards adjacent to RS9 zoning. Existing trees in this area will remain where feasible. In working with staff, the petitioner has also submitted attractive building elevations. Staff believes the request is consistent with the recommendations of the area plan and <i>Legacy</i> and will serve as a suitable transition between Country Club Road and the adjacent neighborhood.</p>

<b>CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION</b>	
<b>Positive Aspects of Proposal</b>	<b>Negative Aspects of Proposal</b>
The majority of the site has been commercially zoned since 1994.	There is no other GB property within this neighborhood-scale activity center.
The use shown on the proposed site plan is not expected to produce many vehicle trips.	
The area plan recommends commercial uses at this site.	
The proposed building is pulled up to Country Club Road, which encourages pedestrian activity.	
Parking and/or vehicular circulation is not proposed along the northern portion of the site, which abuts single-family homes.	
<b>SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL</b>	
The following conditions are proposed from interdepartmental review comments to meet established standards or to reduce negative off-site impacts:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.</li> <li>b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem and NCDOT; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of the driveway permit(s). Required improvements include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dedication of an additional ten (10) feet of right-of-way along Country Club Road.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.</li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.</li> <li>b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.</li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>OTHER REQUIREMENTS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. As volunteered by the petitioner, no freestanding signage shall be permitted on the site.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval**

**NOTE:** These are **staff comments** only; the City-County Planning Board makes final recommendations, and final action is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, which may approve, deny, continue or request modification to any request. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

---

---

# CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD

## PUBLIC HEARING

### MINUTES FOR W-3449

### AUGUST 13, 2020

Gary Roberts presented the staff report.

#### PUBLIC HEARING

FOR:

Luke Dickey, Stimmel Associates, PA, 601 North Trade Street, Suite 200, Winston-Salem, NC 27101

- This is a two-story storage building (with basement) pushed to the front of the site. There will be a two-story elevation from Country Club Road, and the rest of the building will be basement level. We have worked with staff on the looks of the façade. Parking will be to the side of the building. A Type III bufferyard will be adjacent to Trinity United Methodist Church. It also wraps around where the meditation garden is, and we agreed to continue the 40-foot undisturbed Type III buffer that was originally approved with the zoning in 2015.
- We have agreed to a condition, as stated, in terms of stormwater management. We are agreeing to go to the 50-year storm from a design standpoint. We are looking at an open sand filter on the backside with some detention. That is not an open water device, which will help with mosquito issues. We are also working with the Stormwater Division about how much water we can take out toward Country Club Road to reduce the amount of discharge that goes into the back neighbors' yards. We are looking at a system that will be located in the parking lot to tie into the existing stormwater system at Country Club Road.
- This will be a low traffic generator for the type of use. We have 12 parking spaces listed on the plan, which shows how much traffic will be generated by this request. When these facilities are built, at first, trip generation is high with people coming to lease, then the trip generation decreases dramatically, resulting in 30 trips per day, making it a very low traffic generator.
- We are proposing to maintain the existing trees on the back side and meet the requirements for the buffer. All of the units will be internal to the building, so it will be access-controlled.
- During COVID, we opted to send letters, as it is hard to hold meetings during COVID time. The letters were generated from GeoData within 500 feet of the proposed request. We received one response from an owner who lives directly behind the proposed facility.
- We believe the proposal meets the *West Suburban Area Plan* and *Legacy 2030*.



George asked Mr. Dickey if there will be any stormwater discharge to the north, to which Mr. Dickey replied yes. The quantity has not been fully designed at this point, but Stimmel Associates is working to see how much can be taken out towards Country Club Road to reduce that amount of discharge, as well as how that amount of discharge can be held so it doesn't come out all at once onto the property behind that location. Two main property owners that would be affected are directly behind the site, which would be Ms. Johnson and Mr. and Mrs. Beamer.

George asked Mr. Dickey if he had talked with the property owners about the concerns others have had regarding the discharge. Mr. Dickey stated that Ms. Johnson mentioned that it was a concern, and that is how the agreement was reached to level it out where it is not so concentrated, along with the 50-year storm condition.

Clarence Lambe asked if the storage facility would house vehicles, boats and/or RVs. Mr. Dickey stated that there would be no outside storage on the site.

Jamie Bennett, 125 North Westview Drive, Winston-Salem, NC 27104

- I am a resident that abuts Country Club Road, so I am very familiar with the corridor and I want this to look good for the community. It is important that we showcase our best efforts and hope everyone can see that.

AGAINST:

Emily Bickle, 3830 Cavalier Drive, Winston-Salem, NC 27104

- Our home is corner-to-corner with the suggested rezoning site, next door to the Beamers. We would like to object to the lack of effort to replace the neighborhood meeting with any additional public notifications for neighbors to comment, and we suggest - in the future - that the City consider posting on the multiple social media platforms that they use to keep residents informed about rezoning. I posted on Next Door and got feedback from several neighbors who are opposed to this.
- There have been numerous issues with the property that's already there. There have been zoning enforcement issues with the shopping center next door to the proposed rezoning that still haven't been resolved. Back in 2015, when this property was rezoned, 30 people came to the neighborhood meeting for that and had voiced concerns about outdoor music and noise, such as what comes from Cross Fit behind the Dollar General shopping center next door. That is not even zoned for outdoor recreation. And we have been trying to get this resolved with the zoning department for a year now. Even during the pandemic, when gyms were supposedly closed, we've still been woken up by tire flipping. So we are really unhappy to see that the proposed zoning for this property would also include outdoor recreation as a use. We would strenuously object to that.
- We get the feeling from what is being proposed that no one in city government is paying much attention or cares about the development of this area. I'm not sure why pedestrian traffic keeps getting mentioned because I really don't see anyone walking to a storage facility. One of the possible uses presented in the 2015 rezoning when the property owner had originally promised to limit the uses of property - which they're now going back on - was a dry cleaner. That was approved by the Planning Board and City back then, and at

that time there were already three dry cleaning solvent cleanup programs in and around the intersection of Gordon Drive and Country Club Road because there is a substantial amount of dry cleaning solvent contamination here. This is one of the reasons we are very concerned about runoff and the amount of impervious surface. The DEQ testing that has been done in our house showed solvents in the water and in the soil are actually affecting the indoor air in our basement.

- As for the 40-foot buffer at the back of the property, looking at the map, there is also a 40-foot buffer at the shopping center next door. We can tell you from experience it really doesn't block any noise at all. It's poorly maintained and not very effective.
- Even if the storage facility is relatively quiet, it is not really what we would like to see as a neighborhood. It doesn't promote walkable business area. It seems extremely large for it adjoining directly with single-family residential property. One of our biggest concerns is this also opens the door for an even less desirable use in the future if this rezoning gets approved. We would like to know if the developer would be willing to take any of these uses off the table. Like agreeing not to have any outdoor recreational use, agreeing not to put a dry cleaner there, or considering an actual physical barrier on either side of the 40-foot buffer area.

Tom Walter, 125 South Gordon Drive, Winston-Salem, NC 27104

- I don't find this structure to be community oriented, and the Gordon Manor Business Center currently houses retail and service businesses that support a small burough of Winston-Salem. A large two-story (above ground) one-story (below ground) storage facility is being built here, but I believe it supports other communities of Winston-Salem, primarily to the east going into Buena Vista.
- In my opinion, there is nothing like meditating in the meditation garden next to a two-story structure. It certainly is not a community project. Gary mentioned this use would not be typical in a location such as this, and I agree 100 percent. This is not commercial in the sense of community and neighborhood. Gordon Manor and South Fork, the services are great that you can walk to; it provides from haircuts to food to convenience stores to the diner. I think there is a much better use for that piece of land to serve and develop for this community. A storage facility, in my mind, is more an industrial-type facility, not something you put in a neighborhood.
- On the Stimmel Associates' preliminary drawing in the lower-right hand, it says: This is a preliminary site plan, limited information, and therefore it may not reflect the actual site features. No site research has been conducted. Site conditions may change significantly. I feel that this is an investment for whatever business is getting into it, and I don't think they have any interest in the community here, and I think that needs to be taken into serious consideration.

Phillip Wynne, 213 Kyle Road, Winston-Salem, NC 27104

- We go to Trinity United Methodist Church. My wife does a lot of work in the prayer garden and it is nice and serene to sit and look back, and if this gets built, we'll be looking at a five-foot wall in the back of a building. From the church parking lot, we'll be looking

at the side of the building and the dumpster. If you look beside the dumpster where the truck pulls in, the dumpster is facing the side of the columbarium. There is also a 250-year-old oak tree on the property, and the arborist has said that it is one of the oldest white oak trees in Forsyth County, and I don't see it on the plans anywhere.

## **WORK SESSION**

In response to a question presented by Clarence, Mr. Bennett agreed to omit outdoor recreation uses, as well as dry cleaner uses as a subcategory of Services, A.

Based on comments from the opponents, Melynda did not feel this was consistent with the comprehensive plan and felt that neighborhoods should be preserved to be neighborhood-serving. Melynda also stated that the GB zoning request in this area would be problematic for ramping up intensity. Melynda asked if the 250-year-old tree was proposed to remain on the site. Mr. Dickey stated that the white oak would not be preserved.

George stated that storage facilities do not need to be in the middle of activity and be of high visibility. Something that generates activity and encourages pedestrian activity should be placed in that community. There are other options for storage buildings other than being in the middle of activity centers.

Jack stated that he would never put a mini-storage facility in the middle of a neighborhood activity center. He stated that the Board needs to rethink what would be an appropriate location for this product. There is a demand for the product, but this is not the place for it.

Jason Grubbs stated that he saw the problem as more related to where these storage facilities fit in the overall zoning scheme, more than the individual cases themselves, and that it's the market that drives developers to put certain things in certain places.

Aaron King discussed staff's review of this case and gave several examples of past cases that were similar in nature. There was further discussion about whether storage facilities belong in GB zoning districts.

George stated that there are creative ways to do this without intruding in activity centers and decreasing activity, and he did not believe this was a creative proposal.

**MOTION:** Clarence Lambe recommended that the Planning Board find that the request is consistent with the comprehensive plan.

**SECOND:** Jason Grubbs

**VOTE:**

**FOR:** Jason Grubbs, Tommy Hicks, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak

**AGAINST:** George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

**EXCUSED:** None

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the zoning petition with the following conditions: omit outdoor recreation uses, as well as dry cleaner uses as a subcategory of Services, A.

SECOND: Jason Grubbs

VOTE:

FOR: Jason Grubbs, Tommy Hicks, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak

AGAINST: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

EXCUSED: None

---

Aaron King  
Director of Planning and Development Services