

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
STAFF REPORT**

<b>PETITION INFORMATION</b>	
<b>Docket #</b>	W-3411
<b>Staff</b>	<a href="#">Kelly Bennett, AICP</a>
<b>Petitioner(s)</b>	Village at Robinhood, LLC
<b>Owner(s)</b>	Same
<b>Subject Property</b>	PIN 5896-66-7126
<b>Address</b>	5109 Robinhood Village Dr
<b>Type of Request</b>	Special Use rezoning from MU-S to GB-S
<b>Proposal</b>	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Map for the subject property <b>from</b> MU-S (Mixed Use – Special Use) <b>to</b> GB-S (General Business – Special Use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Arts and Crafts Studio; Banking and Financial Services; Car Wash; Club or Lodge; Combined Use; Convenience Store; Food or Drug Store; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; Library, Public; Museum or Art Gallery; Nursery, Lawn and Garden Supply Store, Retail; Offices; Police or Fire Station; Recreation Services, Indoor; Recreation Services, Outdoor; Restaurant (with drive-through Service); Restaurant (without drive-through Service); Retail Store; School, Vocational or Professional; Services A; Storage Services, Retail; Swimming Pool, Private; Testing and Research Lab; Theater, Indoor; Utilities; Veterinary Services; Child Day Care Center; Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Duplex</li> </ul>
<b>Neighborhood Contact/Meeting</b>	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.
<b>Zoning District Purpose Statement</b>	The GB District is primarily intended to accommodate a wide range of retail, service, and office uses located along thoroughfares in areas which have developed with minimal front setbacks. However, the district is not intended to encourage or accommodate strip commercial development. The district would accommodate destination retail and service uses, characterized by either a larger single business use or the consolidation of numerous uses in a building or planned development, with consolidated access. This district is intended for application in GMAs 1, 2 and 3 and Metro Activity Centers.
<b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b>	<b>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?</b>
	Yes. The site is located adjacent to the commercial portion of a MU-S development within GMA 3.

GENERAL SITE INFORMATION						
<b>Location</b>	The subject property is located on the northwest corner of Fleetwood Circle and Attanook Road.					
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	City of Winston-Salem					
<b>Site Acreage</b>	±1.84 acres					
<b>Current Land Use</b>	The site is partially developed with a parking lot and sidewalks.					
<b>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</b>	<b>Direction</b>	<b>Zoning District</b>		<b>Use</b>		
	North	RS9		Single-family homes and undeveloped property		
	East	RS9		Single-family homes		
	South	MU-S		Undeveloped property and single-family homes		
	West	MU-S		Shopping center		
<b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b>	<b>(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?</b>					
	Yes. The subject property is part of the Village at Robinhood, a shopping center with a variety of commercial uses.					
<b>Physical Characteristics</b>	The building site is graded and surrounded by a parking lot.					
<b>Proximity to Water and Sewer</b>	The site has access to public water and sewer.					
<b>Stormwater/ Drainage</b>	The proposed development is covered under an existing stormwater management plan that was issued on 07/26/2006 for the overall Village at Robinhood development and is exempt from compliance with the current Post Construction Stormwater Management ordinance, which was adopted in 2008. The stormwater management plan was designed for 75% total impervious area build out of the site, and the current plan is within that design percentage. Prior to issuance of grading permits, the location of the storm drainage conveyance system must be approved to ensure there are no impacts to adjacent properties and the storm drainage is being conveyed to the area it was intended.					
<b>Watershed and Overlay Districts</b>	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.					
<b>Analysis of General Site Information</b>	The site is part of a previously graded section of a larger commercial development. Parking for the site was previously constructed. The site does not contain any designated watershed or regulatory floodplain areas.					
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-2913	Forsyth County MU-S to Winston-Salem MU-S	Approved 5/7/2007	Included current site	33.65	Approval	Approval

F-1417A	RS9 to MU-S	Approved 9/12/2005	Included current site	33.71	Approval	Approval
F-1524	RS9 to LB-S	Approved 11/8/2010	South	2.15	Approval	Approval
F-1501	LB-L to LB-L	Denied 10/13/2008	West	1.17	Denial	Denial
F-1496	LB-L to LB-L	Approved 3/10/2008	West	1.17	Approval	Denial
F-1491	RS9 and LB to LB-L	Approved 12/17/2007	West	1.17	Approval	Approval

**SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION**

<b>Street Name</b>	<b>Classification</b>	<b>Frontage</b>	<b>Average Daily Trip Count</b>	<b>Capacity at Level of Service D</b>
Fleetwood Circle	Local Street	± 283 feet	N/A	N/A
Attanook Road	Collector Street	± 433 feet	730	N/A
<b>Proposed Access Point(s)</b>	The site will have direct access onto Fleetwood Circle utilizing an existing driveway. No changes are proposed to the location or dimensions of this access.			
<b>Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed</b>	<p><u>Existing Zoning: MU-S</u> This section of the previously approved mixed-use development was approved for 10 live/work housing units:</p> <p>10 units x 5.81 (Residential Condominium/Townhouse Trip Rate) = 58 Trips per Day</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: GB-S</u> 97,000 sf / 1,000 x 2.5 (Mini-warehouse Trip Rate) = 243 Trips per Day</p>			
<b>Sidewalks</b>	Sidewalk is located along Fleetwood Circle and Attanook Road.			
<b>Transit</b>	WSTA Route 109 serves the intersection of Robinhood Road and Polo Road approximately 3.2 miles east.			
<b>Connectivity</b>	The subject property connects to the larger shopping center to the west through the existing parking lot.			
<b>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</b>	The proposed use has a much higher daily trip rate than the previously approved live/work residential units; however, roads in the area still have ample capacity. The site will be accessed from Fleetwood Circle, which connects to Robinhood Road via Meadowlark Drive. Robinhood Road is a major thoroughfare with an average daily trip count of 7,600 and a capacity of 13,800. Staff does not foresee any transportation issues associated with this request.			

**SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS**

<b>Building Square Footage</b>	<b>Square Footage</b>		<b>Placement on Site</b>
	97,000		Central portion
<b>Parking</b>	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Layout</b>
	8 spaces	13 spaces	90-degree head-in

<b>Building Height</b>	<b>Maximum</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
	60 feet	Three stories
<b>Impervious Coverage</b>	<b>Maximum</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
	75 percent (overall development)	64.22 percent
<b>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.3 (J) General Business District</li> </ul>	
<b>Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3</b>	(A) <i>Legacy 2030 policies:</i>	Yes
	(B) <i>Environmental Ord.</i>	N/A
	(C) <b>Subdivision Regulations</b>	N/A
<b>Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements</b>	<p>The site plan proposes a 97,000-square foot indoor self-storage building located on the eastern edge of a shopping center in a mixed-use zoning district. The building will be accessed from Fleetwood Circle and from within the Village at Robinhood shopping center. The building’s western and southern façades include glazing, façade articulation, and three tower structures to help make it a better fit with the shopping center’s architecture. The neck-down at the center of the building also helps the building fit better with its surroundings. The building’s eastern façade, which faces Attanook Road and a single-family neighborhood, includes many faux windows, but also a large expanse of blank wall. The site plan complies with minimum UDO requirements, which include a 20-foot Type III bufferyard on the northern part of the property contiguous to a single-family neighborhood. The site plan also shows the site ringed by canopy trees on the northern, western, and southern sides and understory trees on the eastern side.</p>	
<b>CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES</b>		
<b>Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area</b>	Growth Management Area 3 – Suburban Neighborhoods	
<b>Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Encourage reuse of vacant and underutilized commercial and industrial sites.</li> <li>Promote compatible infill development that fits with the context of its surroundings.</li> <li>Encourage redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with the surrounding area.</li> </ul>	
<b>Relevant Area Plan(s)</b>	<i>West Suburban Area Plan Update (2018)</i>	

<p><b>Area Plan Recommendations</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The area plan recommends commercial use for this site.</li> <li>• The redevelopment of existing undeveloped and underutilized sites is recommended.</li> <li>• The area plan calls for the creation of new commercial opportunities and the improvement of existing commercial areas to blend with existing development and not negatively impact nearby neighborhoods.</li> <li>• The plan recommends that land uses in this activity center should be linked to each other and to adjoining properties through vehicular and pedestrian connections. The plan also recommends the installation of bufferyards, streetyards, and parking area plantings. The plan notes that the existing Robinhood Village development has large expanses of transparent glass and other elements of pedestrian oriented design. Any new development here should also demonstrate pedestrian oriented design.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Site Located Along Growth Corridor?</b></p>	<p>The site is not located along a growth corridor.</p>
<p><b>Site Located within Activity Center?</b></p>	<p>The site is located within Robinhood Village Activity Center.</p>
<p><b>Comprehensive Transportation Plan Information</b></p>	<p>The <i>Comprehensive Transportation Plan</i> recommends a four-lane section with a landscaped median, wide outside lanes, and sidewalks for this portion of Robinhood Road.</p>
<p><b>Addressing</b></p>	<p>The address will remain the same.</p>
<p><b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b></p>	<p><b>(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?</b></p>
	<p>No.</p>
	<p><b>(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?</b></p>
<p><b>Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues</b></p>	<p><i>Legacy</i> recommends redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with their surrounding areas. The <i>West Suburban Area Plan Update</i> recommends mixed-use development for the subject property, along with several site-specific design recommendations. The plan notes that the existing Robinhood Village development has large expanses of transparent glass and other elements of pedestrian-oriented design. Any new development here should also demonstrate pedestrian-oriented design. These recommendations are intended to allow increased activity on the site, provided it occurs in a manner that is sensitive to the residential setting of the area to the east of the development. The previously approved mixed-use site plan shows ten live/work units in two small-footprint buildings, which would accomplish these goals.</p> <p>Self-storage units are not typically a desired component of a mixed-use development. They do not generally contribute activity to an area and their design does not typically fit in with commercial or residential</p>

development. Their large building footprints also limit activity and discourage the development of surrounding active land uses. However, given the subject property's location at the edge of the activity center, which is directly adjacent to a single-family neighborhood, the proposed self-storage building may provide a more desirable transition than other commercial uses because of its low potential for traffic generation. The developer for this project has also submitted a site plan and building elevations that go a long way toward fitting in with surrounding development. The neck-down at the center of the building helps reduce the mass of the building, while faux windows on street-facing elevations, building articulation, and three corner tower embellishments make the proposed building more in keeping with its surroundings.

Staff does not see this request as an ideal proposal, but given the slow market for this larger mixed-use development, a self-storage building that fits in with its surroundings may be a net positive.

**CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION**

<b>Positive Aspects of Proposal</b>	<b>Negative Aspects of Proposal</b>
The request would add a commercial use to an underdeveloped site.	Much of the three-story wall facing the single-family neighborhood to the east is blank.
The site plan includes bufferyards and stormwater management to reduce impacts on neighboring single-family parcels.	The massing of the proposed building is greater than the previously approved live/work buildings.
The proposed building includes many architectural elements that help it fit in with surrounding development.	
The surrounding roads, including Robinhood Road, have ample capacity.	
The request may spur additional development in the general area.	

**SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  - a. The location of the storm drainage conveyance system must be approved to ensure there are no impacts to adjacent properties and the storm drainage is being conveyed to the area it was intended in the previously approved stormwater management plan.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff. All rooftop HVAC equipment shall be screened from view of the adjacent streets.
  - b. Any retaining wall shall be earth tone in color or shall match the color of the primary building as approved by Planning staff.
  - c. Developer shall record a 25-foot cross-access easement to the property to the west.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE(S) OF OCCUPANCY:**
  - a. Any damage to City-maintained streets, sidewalk, or curb shall be replaced or repaired to the requirements of the Public Works Department.
  - b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.
  
- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  - a. The subject property shall not have any freestanding signage. Wall signs shall be limited to the western and southern building facades.
  - b. Foundation plantings shall be installed as shown in the renderings submitted with the rezoning petition.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval**

**NOTE:** These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

---

---

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
PUBLIC HEARING  
MINUTES FOR W-3411  
MAY 23, 2019**

Desmond Corley presented the staff report.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

**WORK SESSION**

George Bryan inquired as to whether this area was an active pedestrian thoroughfare with heavy pedestrian traffic, as the renderings indicated. George stated that he would not be in favor of the petition if there was heavy pedestrian traffic around a building that did not have retail in it.

Aaron King noted that any pedestrian traffic would likely be coming from the multifamily units and grocery store from the west.

George brought up the concern of mixed use not serving its intended purpose, despite the high hopes from a zoning and planning standpoint.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the zoning petition and certified the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all code requirements if the petition is approved.

SECOND: Jason Grubbs

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Jason Grubbs, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Brenda Smith

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

---

Aaron King  
Director of Planning and Development Services