

City of Greensboro					
Cities	Disparity Study Sample Recommendations	Do we currently do this?	Can we do this without a Disparity Study?	Industry Best Practices	Notes
City of Greensboro (2012)	Selective use of vendor rotation to expand utilization of MWBE groups and to limit habitual repetitive use of incumbent majority firms.	Yes, we use vendor rotation on contracts estimated to cost less than \$20,000. Primarily in Community Development this may include rehabilitation, construction, code enforcement and professional services.	Yes	Consider a system of bidder rotation for majority and MWBE firms.	Staff has developed a vendor rotation guide and sample models for discretionary spending. Although contracts must be awarded to the lowest, responsive, responsible bidder; staff has implemented a policy which allows the City Manager to reserve goods, professional, and other service contracts that are valued below \$20,000 and fairly routine in nature to pre-qualified M/WBE firms on a rotating basis.
	Add language to RFPs, asking proposers about their strategies for M/WBE inclusion on the project.	Yes, for all projects estimated to cost more than \$20,000 M/WBE Affidavits and/or M/WBE Good Faith Efforts are required.	Yes	A number of agencies have had success in soliciting creative responses to these request even in areas such as large-scale insurance contracts.	N/A
	Increase MWBE participation through a Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program utilizing race- and gender-neutral alternatives to address disparities in purchasing.	No, the City's program has race and gender goals as defined through North Carolina's MWBE program and as supported by historical statewide disparity studies.	No	Meet M/WBE goals, aspirational or not, with race and gender-neutral means.	N/A
	Set aspirational goals by business category, not rigid project goals, based on relative MWBE availability. This is obtainable through a Small Business Enterprise (SBE) program. New goals would be: construction prime contracting (14%); professional services (11%); goods & services (8%); construction subcontracting (15%).	No, the City has a 10% minimum goal on all prime construction projects (estimated \$300,000+) that may be set higher if opportunities are available. There are no goals set for other procurement categories such goods& services, informal construction, nor construction prime contracting.	No	Set aspirational goals for all levels of procurement including goods & services, informal construction, and construction prime contracting.	Unless a formal construction project is extremely specialized the M/WBE goals are set higher than 10%, based on the availability of MWBE firms and the scope of work. Staff is currently incorporating additional ways to set aspirational goals on other procurement areas.

City of Charlotte					
Cities	Disparity Study Major Recommendations	Do we currently do this?	Can we do this without a Disparity Study?	Industry Best Practices	Notes
City of Charlotte (2017)	Implementation of a program that requires prime contractors to include certain minimum levels of subcontracting as a part of their bids and proposals for specific types of contracting where subcontracting or partnership opportunities exist.	Yes, a minimum 10% M/WBE participation is set on all formal construction projects on a project-by-project basis. A 10% minimum is also set on all professional service proposals.	Yes	Set M/WBE participation goals on formal construction projects in order to require a certain percentage to be met or exceeded.	FY 16-17 average percentage set on formal construction was 14%. Final M/WBE participation was 20%.
	Implementation of a process that connects contracting data more intuitively with corresponding payment data from the beginning of a contract to its completion. Collection of comprehensive data on all subcontracts regardless of whether they are performed by an M/WBE.	Staff utilizes the data from Affidavit F- "Minority Documentation for Contract Payment" into a Project Summary Report which tracks all payments made to M/WBE firms.	Yes	Track all subcontracting regardless of M/WBE status in order to more accurately monitor the participation of M/WBE firms and potential opportunities for their participation.	Staff can revise M/WBE affidavits to include payments made to non-MWBE firms.
	Limit M/WBE certification to those M/WBE firms that are small and disadvantaged based on size and personal net worth similar to the Federal Disadvantaged Business Program.	No, the City's program relies heavily on the North Carolina Department of Administration's Historically Underutilized Businesses (HUB) database to certify MBE's and WBE's in which revenue nor net worth requirements are associated with certification.	No	The State HUB database is used as the certifying agency across the state of North Carolina in order to minimize and/or eliminate the need for M/WBE firms to be certified by multiple agencies.	N/A
	Continuing efforts to unbundle contracts by encouraging prime contractors to unbundle subcontracting opportunities into smaller sizes and accept such attempts as good faith efforts.	Yes, a part of the good faith effort process requires a prime contractor to identify and select portions of the work to be performed by M/WBE firms in order to increase the likelihood of M/WBE participation, including where appropriate breaking down contracts into economically feasible units to facilitate M/WBE participation, in order to receive credit.	Yes	Unbundling contracts results in the work being more accessible to small businesses, which in return might increase opportunities for M/WBE firms and result in greater M/WBE participation.	N/A

City of Durham and Durham County					
Cities	Disparity Study Major Recommendations	Do we currently do this?	Can we do this without a Disparity Study?	Industry Best Practices	Recommendation
City of Durham & Durham County Multi-jurisdictional (2015)	Provide resources to SBE and M/WBE firms by utilizing non-profit organizations for loans, bonding, and forming agreements with local banks to provide funding to MWBE firms.	No, the Small Business Loan Opportunity has been proposed but not yet adopted.	Yes	Make M/WBE firms aware of the avenues available through bonding agencies and other small business agencies.	*Date loan program was introduced and status*
	Provide additional opportunities for M/WBE firms to understand and ask questions about the bid specifications.	Yes, opportunities are provided through pre-bid meetings, and educational workshops hosted by staff and collaborating partners.	Yes	Provide outreach resources in the form of contractor education through semi-regular classes and workshops.	Continuous Workshops: Bidding and Estimating 101, Bonding & Insurance Assistance, The Mixer, Is Your Good Faith Effort Good Enough, Technical HUB application assistance.
	Encourage the use of joint ventures and mentor-protégé programs when available	No, the City bids formal construction projects a single prime bids. The incorporation of joint ventures and mentor protégé are prominent with the construction manger at-risk (CMAR) approach.	Yes	Various delivery methods are used throughout the state, Single Prime, Construction Manager At-Risk, Design Build	N/A