

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION			
Docket	W-3554		
Staff	Marc Allred		
Petitioner(s)	James Howard, Kerry Howard, and Margo Cooper		
Owner(s)	Same		
Subject Property	PINs 6823-51-3070 and 6823-51-8174		
Address	This vacant site is not currently addressed.		
Type of Request	Special Use rezoning		
Proposal	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Map for the subject property from RS9 (Residential Single Family – 9,000 square feet minimum lot size) and RM12-S (Residential, Multifamily – 12 units per acre) to RM12-S (Residential, Multifamily – 12 units per acre). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Planned Residential Development 		
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.		
Zoning District Purpose Statement	The RM12 District is primarily intended to accommodate multifamily uses at a maximum overall density of twelve (12) units per acre. This district is appropriate for GMAs 1, 2, and 3 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services, are available.		
Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?		
	Yes. The site is in GMA 3 and has adequate access to public infrastructure.		
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION			
Location	East side of Stafford Place Boulevard, south of Stafford Place Circle.		
Jurisdiction	City of Winston-Salem		
Ward(s)	South Ward		
Ward(s) July 2023	South Ward		
Site Acreage	± 18.91 acres		
Current Land Use	Undeveloped Land		
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use
	North	RM12-S	Apartments
	East	MRB-S	Retail Stores
	South	RS9	Single-family homes
	West	RM18-S	Apartments

Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?					
	Yes, the proposed uses are compatible with the proposed RM12-S zoning district and the adjacent properties.					
Physical Characteristics	The site is undeveloped and wooded. There is an intermittent stream that runs through the middle of the proposed development. PIN 6823-51-3070 slopes to the east and PIN 6823-51-8174 slopes to the west with varying degrees of elevation change.					
Proximity to Water and Sewer	Public water and sewer are available to this site.					
Stormwater/ Drainage	The proposed plan depicts two stormwater control devices to manage each portion of the development. Stafford Forest Drive will cross the stream running through the site with a culvert connecting each side of the development.					
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located in a water supply watershed.					
Analysis of General Site Information	The subject property is currently undeveloped and slopes towards an intermittent stream. The site has adequate access to public utilities and is not located within a water supply watershed.					
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3438	RS9 to RM12-S	Approved; 7/6/2020	Current Site	9.81	Approval	Approval
W-3366	MU-S to RM12-S	Approved; 5/7/18	North	11.10	Approval	Approval
W-3215	RS9 to RM18-S	Approved; 5/5/14	West	9.83	Approval	Approval
W-2757	RS9 to MRB-S	Approved; 5/2/2005	East	29.44	Approval	Approval
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION						
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D		
Stafford Place Boulevard	Local Street	184 feet	N/A	N/A		
Proposed Access Point(s)	The site will be accessed at the terminus of the public street right-of-way of Stafford Place Boulevard. The developer is also proposing a private street stub towards the existing Cedar Post Road street stub. However, a seven foot strip of land in separate ownership exists between the public right-of-way and the subject property which prevents a connection being made at this time.					
Proposed Road Improvements	No off-site road improvements are proposed.					

<p>Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed</p>	<p><u>Existing Zoning: RS9</u> 9.2 acres = 44 homes x 9.57 (single-family trip rate) = 421 trips per day</p> <p><u>Existing Zoning: R12-S</u> 72 units x 6.65 (apartment trip rate) = 478 trips per day</p> <p>Existing total trip generation = 899 trips per day.</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: RM12-S</u> 192 units x 6.65 (apartment trip rate) = 1,277 trips per day</p>
<p>Sidewalks</p>	<p>Sidewalks currently exist along both sides of Stafford Place Boulevard and on the south side of Stafford Village Boulevard between Town Square Drive and Peters Creek Parkway.</p> <p>Internal pedestrian pathways are shown along the parking areas in front of the proposed buildings and along the main access leading to Stafford Place Boulevard.</p> <p>Due to topography issues, a pedestrian connection accessing the Walmart shopping center to the east is not feasible.</p>
<p>Transit</p>	<p>WSTA routes 83 and 101 have stops at the Walmart shopping center at the corner of Peters Creek Parkway and Stafford Village Boulevard. It is a 0.7 mile walk from the bus stop to the proposed development access point on Stafford Place Boulevard.</p>
<p>Connectivity</p>	<p>The site connects to the neighboring multifamily development at the southern terminus of the publicly maintained portion of Stafford Place Boulevard. A private stub street is shown that would allow for a future connection to Cedar Post Road to the south; An intervening strip of land currently prevents the connection from being made.</p>
<p>Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)</p>	<p>TIA is not required for this development.</p>
<p>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</p>	<p>The site will have one access point from Stafford Place Boulevard. The site plan depicts three streets within the development. Transit is available at the Walmart shopping center at the corner of Stafford Village Boulevard and Peters Creek Parkway. Sidewalks exist along Stafford Place Boulevard and Stafford Village Boulevard to allow for safe pedestrian access to the shopping center and to public transit.</p>

SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS			
Building Square Footage	Square Footage		Placement on Site
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building 100, 400, and 500 – 25,668 Square Feet each • Building 200, 300, 600, and 700 – 25,141 Square Feet each • Building 800 – 26,208 Square Feet • Community Center – 2,292 Square Feet 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building 100, 400, and 500 will be located on the southside of Stafford Forest Drive. • Building 200 and 300 will be located on the southwest part of property. • Building 600 and 700 will be located on the southeast part of property. • Building 800 and Community Center will be located on north side of Stafford Forest Drive.
Units (by type) and Density	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One bedroom – 30 units • Two bedroom – 80 units • <u>Three bedroom – 82 units</u> <p>Total units = 192 units</p> <p>192 units/18.91 acres = 10.15 units per acre</p>		
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout
	Vehicle – 349 Bicycle – 20	Vehicle – 355 Bicycle – 20	Vehicle – 90-degree parking Bicycle – five racks with four spaces each
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed
	45'		40'
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed
	75%		33%
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Section 4.5.13: RM12; Residential Multifamily District • Section 5.2.71: Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; or Residential Building, Twin Home (W) (use-specific standards) • Table 6.1.2: Motor Vehicle and Bicycle Parking Space Requirements 		
Complies with Section 3.2.11	(A) Legacy 2030 policies:	Yes	
	(B) Environmental Ord.	N/A	
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	N/A	
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	<p>The proposed site plan depicts eight multifamily apartment buildings and one community center. The community center is located near the proposed access point at Stafford Place Boulevard. Common recreation areas are proposed in the southeastern and northeastern portion of the site. The site plan shows a required 40' Type II Bufferyard adjacent to the adjoining RS9-zoned properties to the south. The developer is proposing a six-foot opaque fence in addition to the bufferyard to screen</p>		

	the southern common recreation area from the adjacent single-family homes.
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES	
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 3 – Suburban Neighborhoods
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concentrate development within the serviceable land area of Forsyth County, with the highest intensities at activity centers. • Encourage the inclusion of housing at higher residential densities in activity centers. • Facilitate land use patterns that offer convenient access to shopping.
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>South Suburban Area Plan Update (2018)</i>
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Intermediate-density residential land use is recommended for sites greater than two acres that are appropriately developed with multifamily or townhouse structures. • The proposed land use map recommends intermediate density residential land use for the western parcel (8.1-18 units per acre) and low-density attached residential (0-8 units per acre) for the eastern parcel.
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is not located along a growth corridor.
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is within the Peters Creek Activity Center.
Comprehensive Transportation Plan Information	No improvements are recommended for Stafford Place Boulevard.
Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	No
	Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy 2030?
	Yes. The site is within a designated activity center and proposes multifamily units that are in proximity to services and employment centers.
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	The request is to rezone an approximately 18.91-acre site from RS9 and RM12-S to RM12-S to construct 192 apartment units.
	The proposal meets the recommendation of the <i>South Suburban Area Plan Update</i> for multifamily development at this location. The proposed development density of 10.15 units per acre is appropriate here.

	<p>Furthermore, the site is directly adjacent to existing multifamily development and lies within the Peters Creek Activity Center.</p> <p>The proposal is supported by the recommendations of <i>Legacy</i>, which recommends that development be concentrated within the serviceable land area and encourages the inclusion of higher density residential development within activity centers.</p>
--	--

CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
The proposal meets the recommendations of the <i>South Suburban Area Plan Update</i> and <i>Legacy 2030</i> .	The site has limited vehicular connectivity, with only one primary access point.
The proposed development would provide additional needed housing units at an appropriate location within the serviceable land area.	The development does not include a direct pedestrian connection to the adjacent shopping center to the east.
The site is located within a designated activity center and has access to multimodal transit.	

SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following conditions are proposed from interdepartmental review comments to meet established standards or to reduce negative off-site impacts:

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
 - a. The developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum and may require a Site Plan Amendment.
 - b. The developer shall cordon off all areas shown on the site plan as stream buffer areas or undisturbed areas. These areas shall be retained and not disturbed. Vegetation in all these areas shall be protected from grading encroachment in accordance with UDO requirements.
 - c. The developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of the driveway permit.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
 - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE(S) OF OCCUPANCY:**
 - a. The developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.
 - b. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.
 - c. The developer shall install a six-foot high opaque fence along the rear of the southern common recreation area as depicted on the site plan.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; the City-County Planning Board makes final recommendations, and final action is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, which may approve, deny, continue, or request modification to any request. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES FOR W-3554 JANUARY 12, 2023

Marc Allred presented the staff report.

George Bryan asked if staff had any concerns about the location of proposed common recreation areas and whether they would be easily accessible to all residents. Marc Allred responded that staff did not.

Brenda Smith asked if the proposed opaque fence would exist in the conjunction with the vegetative buffer. Marc responded yes, the vegetative buffer would be on the outside of the fence and extend along the entire south side of the site, adjacent to the single-family residential neighborhood.

George asked whether staff considering this site walkable to Wal-Mart. Chris Murphy stated there are existing sidewalks along Stafford Village Boulevard that will allow residents to access the commercial areas at the intersection with Peters Creek Parkway.

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR:

Davis Ray, 5614 Riverdale Drive, Jamestown, NC 27282

- Mr. Ray gave a brief overview of the project

AGAINST:

Angela Caudle, 1705 Cedarberry Court, Winston-Salem, NC 27127

- I have been a landowner here for 35 years. This site used to be a tobacco farm.
- I understand the need for housing. I am fine with development but am concerned that I will be looking out from my patio into somebody's home.
- I am not sure how this development adds value to my home.
- As a native American, the creek and wildlife drew me to this area. I am afraid that this will be going away now.

Debra Kelker, 1617 Kesteven Road, Winston-Salem, NC 27127

- I have three concerns.

- I know the Board had concerns when they approved the adjacent 72-unit development with a single access point. This project will add 192 more units on top of the existing 72. We have concerns regarding the stub street where this development could connect with our subdivision.
- I have a very high concern for my property value. The property between this development and our subdivision went from a value of \$33,300 on January 7, 2020 to a value of \$4,600 on September 1, 2020.
- Will the stub street be closed off as part of the proposed bufferyard?
- Many residents of our subdivision regularly walk to Wal-Mart and Lowes. If built, residents of this project will be able to walk through our neighborhood to access Wal-Mart.
- If you take down the trees on this site, you leave our tall trees in a very precarious position. They may fall without support.

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended that the Planning Board find that the request is consistent with the comprehensive plan.

SECOND: Jason Grubbs

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Walter Farabee, Jason Grubbs, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Mo McRae, Salvador Patiño, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the ordinance amendment.

SECOND: Jason Grubbs

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Walter Farabee, Jason Grubbs, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Mo McRae, Salvador Patiño, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Chris Murphy, AICP/CZO
Director of Planning and Development Services