



Winston-Salem

Office of
Performance &
Accountability

P.O. Box 2511
Winston-Salem, NC 27102
CityLink 311 (336.727.8000)
Fax 336.727.2878
www.cityofws.org

Memorandum

TO: Tasha Logan Ford, Assistant City Manager; Johnnie Taylor, Director of Operations
FROM: Scott Tesh, Performance and Accountability Director
DATE: 7/15/2020
SUBJECT: Police Patrol Vehicle Costs
CC: Lee Garrity, City Manager; Ben Rowe, Assistant City Manager; Catrina Thompson, Police Chief; Pat Edmond, Fleet Services Supervisor; Jerry Bates, Purchasing Director

The transition to the Ford Interceptor SUV (Explorer) platform came as a joint recommendation from the Police Department and Fleet Services as part of the FY 2019-20 budget process. That recommendation was based on better service dependability, lower maintenance costs, fewer preventable accidents due to increased safety features, and concerns related to the Charger (and Caprice).

Specifically, the officers in the Chargers are experiencing more downtime related to engine and suspension issues. Discussions with fleet management personnel in other jurisdictions yielded similar maintenance issues. Both Raleigh and Charlotte transitioned from the Charger to the Interceptor SUV after experiencing unexpected maintenance concerns and associated cost increases. In addition to maintenance concerns and increased safety, the Police Department also recommends the Interceptor SUV for versatility. The increased space will provide more room for field officer training and increased capacity to delivery supplies during emergency situations

In June 2020, the City Manager requested that OPA work with the Police and Purchasing Departments to gather data on purchase price, maintenance costs, warranties, etc. for Dodge Charger (Charger) and Ford Interceptor SUV (Explorer) police car packages. Mr. Garrity requested an analysis of total life cycle costs, and short and long term budget/cash implications of vehicle selection. This memo will provide estimated life cycle costs for the vehicles, other pertinent vehicle information, budget implications, and other considerations. The most notable other consideration is vehicle availability and delivery schedule.

Vehicle Cost and Budget Information

The table below provides estimated life cycle costs for the Charger and Explorer. Note that two Explorers are shown with different motors. The 3.0L EcoBoost (turbocharged) engine was in the specification provided by the Purchasing and Police Departments. Raleigh and Charlotte have converted their patrol fleets to the Explorer with the 3.3L, naturally aspirated V6 engine.

CityLink311

Call 311 or 336-727-8000
citylink@cityofws.org

City Council: Mayor Allen Joines; Denise D. Adams, Mayor Pro Tempore, North Ward; Dan Besse, Southwest Ward; Robert C. Clark, West Ward; John C. Larson, South Ward; Jeff MacIntosh, Northwest Ward; Morticia "Tee-Tee" Parmon, Northeast Ward; Annette Scippio, East Ward; James Taylor, Jr., Southeast Ward; City Manager: Lee D. Garrity

	<u>Dodge Charger</u>	<u>Ford SUV Interceptor 3.0L EcoBoost</u>	<u>Ford SUV Interceptor 3.3L</u>
Cost Information			
Purchase Costs	\$24,349	\$37,007	\$32,946
Upfit Costs	6,180	7,000	7,000
M&R Costs	15,381	13,620	13,620
Fuel Costs	12,632	12,632	12,632
Surplus Value	-2,435	-3,701	-3,295
Total	\$56,107	\$66,558	\$62,903

The full costing methodology can be provided for the estimates above. The most notable assumption is in the lifetime maintenance and repair cost estimate. Because the City of Winston-Salem does not have enough Explorers in the police fleet to analyze and estimate long term costs, City of Raleigh data was used. Charger and Explorer costs were extrapolated out to 120,000 miles (estimated replacement). The lifetime cost of the 3.3L Explorer is \$6,796 per vehicle more than the Charger.

In the short term, purchasing the Explorer with available appropriations (from the FY 21 budget and carry-over from prior years) means receiving fewer vehicles in total. Approximately \$2.4 million dollars is available, which would allow for the purchase and complete upfit of approximately sixty (60) Explorers or seventy-nine (79) Chargers. Budget and Police can provide more specific details on purchase quantities based on equipment currently in stock for builds. To estimate the long-term fiscal impact of purchasing the Explorer at the estimated lifecycle cost difference, we multiply the cost difference by the total number of police vehicles in the “police patrol” monitor group (439), which yields \$2.98 million dollars, not accounting for inflation over time. Because the City finances the purchase of police vehicles over five years, the immediate budget impact would total \$1,883 per vehicle. The adopted FY 20-21 budget provides for the purchase of 40 Explorers, accounting for the increased cost per vehicle.

Other Vehicle Information

Powertrain Warranty - In addition to the cost data provided above, the City’s Fleet Services Department has received information from quotes for vehicles showing that Ford will offer an extended warranty on the Interceptor SUV of 9 years or 100,000 miles. Dodge will provide a 5 year, 100,000 mile warranty. The difference in potential savings from this warranty is not calculated into the estimate above.

All-Wheel Drive (AWD) – The current Dodge Chargers WSPD has been buying are equipped with AWD, which is a safety feature and provides for better traction in inclement weather. The 2021 Ford Interceptor comes with AWD. The 2021 V-8 Charger is not available with AWD.

Fuel Mileage – The estimated fuel costs above are the same as both vehicles get an estimated 19 miles per gallon combined (city and highway). The rear-wheel drive

version of the Charger is slightly more fuel efficient than the current AWD version (one mile per gallon difference).

Space and Versatility – The Ford Interceptor SUV has more front, rear, and interior cargo space than the Dodge Charger. WSPD has indicated the additional space makes the vehicle more versatile and provides more adequate space for field training officers.

Vehicle Availability and Delivery Timeline

The FY 2020 Dodge Charger order (31 vehicles) was cancelled several months ago. According to WSPD fleet management records, the absence of those vehicles will most likely mean that WSPD runs out of available vehicles for the recruit class graduating in December. The Ford representative has provided a delivery timeline of 18-20 weeks from order date. If Council approved a contract in mid-August, delivery could take place in late December. The Dodge representative has stated that production of the Chargers is not expected to begin until “late November or early December” with deliveries beginning to take place in the Spring. He also noted in communications that the effects of coronavirus on production are not factored into this timeline. It must be noted that Dodge amended their delivery schedule by several months before our most recent order was cancelled. If Chargers are ordered, delivery would most likely happen between April and July. Based on WSPD’s projected need for vehicles late this calendar year, Ford is the only option that could potentially provide delivery of vehicles to meet that need. Other strategies could be considered to bridge any gap in needs, but the scope of this analysis only included reviewing the purchase of Chargers and Interceptor SUVs.

Police and Fleet Vehicle Recommendation

The Ford Interceptor SUV is a more cost effective and dependable option to other police-ready SUV packages from Chevrolet and Dodge, and no other known police-ready sedan packages are being offered after FY 2021.

As noted above, the FY 2021 budget included the purchase of Explorers for WSPD. If you need additional information or back-up, please let me know.