



# W-3603 Bethania Forest (Special Use Rezoning from RS9 to RM8-S)



Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building  
100 East First Street, Suite 225  
Winston-Salem, NC 27101  
Fax: 336-748-3163

Phone: 336-747-7040

City of W-S Planning

Stephen Owen  
Stimmel Associates, PA  
601 North Trade Street  
Suite 200  
Winston Salem, NC 27101

Project Name: W-3603 Bethania Forest (Special Use Rezoning  
from RS9 to RM8-S)  
Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem  
ProjectID: 1129512

Wednesday, November 1, 2023

The comments listed below reflect remaining issues that must be addressed before your request can proceed to the Planning Board. All outstanding issues included in this list must be satisfactorily addressed on the revised site plan and re-submitted back to Planning staff no later than 5:00pm on the Thursday two weeks before (14 days prior to) the Planning Board meeting.

## Open Issues: 15

### Engineering

### General Issues

#### 11. General comments

City of Winston-Salem

Matthew Gantt

336-727-8000

[matthewg@cityofws.org](mailto:matthewg@cityofws.org)

10/5/23 1:43 PM

01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

**The following item is required for approval:**

1. A City driveway permit would be required for the permanent connections to Queens Grant Road, Bear Creek Road, and Bethania Road. To obtain a driveway permit, complete and sign a City driveway permit application and submit it, along with a copy of the site plan, to the Engineering Division for review. A review fee of \$200 is also required. All items may be submitted through IDT plans.

**These following items are required for the detailed plan review:**

2. Design calculations would be required for any proposed storm drainage systems. Calculations may be shown on the plan sheets in tabular form. Also include roadway profiles for proposed streets.

3. Construction details would need to be shown for storm drainage elements, roadway cross sections, sidewalks, curbing, and wheelchair ramps. Please include construction detail V-13 from the City IDS Manual for a commercial driveway.

4. Provide a building envelope and residential driveway location for each individual home lot.

5. Please provide elevations for all proposed retaining walls. Retaining walls greater than 10' in height must be approved by the Assistant City Manager.

6. Final, sealed design plans and supporting design calculations are required for culvert that is proposed beneath Allred Farm Road and Carlyle Grove Road. Driveway permitting plans may not note culvert and retaining wall designs to be completed "by others". The types of pipe that have been proposed must conform to the requirements of the City IDS Manual.

7. Please provide 10' x 70' sight triangles for all exit points from the project. Include driveway radii for all proposed driveway connections.

8. Any stub roads with a length in excess of 150 feet must have an acceptable turn-around.

9. Please include the "Roadway" and "Roadway Final Inspection Procedure" notes from the City IDS Manual. These notes are located on pages III-3 and III-6 of the Manual.

10. Please note the following items on the plan, (a) to contact the Engineering Field Office (EFO) at 336-727-8063 to set up inspections, prior to construction, (b) on the plan, include phone numbers and email addresses for the engineer and project owner, and (c) that the driveway permit will expire one year from the date of issuance.

11. For final driveway permit approval, the final set of plans must be marked "FINAL – Released for Construction".

Stimmel Associates, PA  
Stephen Owen  
(336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
10/26/23 1:14 PM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

## 29. General comments

City of Winston-Salem  
Matthew Gantt  
336-727-8000  
[matthewg@cityofws.org](mailto:matthewg@cityofws.org)  
10/30/23 7:25 AM  
01.03a) PC Review - 3

**The following comments are in addition to the initial set of notes documented on 10/5/23.**

1. A City driveway permit would be required for the permanent connection to the new Bethania Forest Drive and Joyce Avenue. To obtain a driveway permit, complete and sign a City driveway permit application and submit it, along with a copy of the site plan to the Engineering Division for review. A review fee of \$200 is also required. All items may be submitted through IDT plans.

## Erosion Control

### General Issues

## 7. Grading/Erosion Control Permit and Erosion Control Plan needed

City of Winston-Salem  
Matthew Osborne  
336-462-7480  
[matthewo@cityofws.org](mailto:matthewo@cityofws.org)  
10/5/23 8:49 AM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

If the proposed project creates more than 10,000 sq. ft. of land disturbance, a Grading/Erosion Control Permit will be required prior to the start of work. In order to obtain this permit you must submit a professionally designed Erosion Control Plan along with an original signed/notarized Financial Responsibility/Ownership (FRO) form for review and approval. Please submit the plan through the electronic plan review portal as application type **04.02 Grading/Erosion Control Permit** at the following link: <https://winston-salem.idtplans.com/secure/>

Stimmel Associates, PA  
Stephen Owen  
(336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
10/26/23 1:14 PM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

## 8. Erosion Control Plan Review to NCDEQ - DEMLR

City of Winston-Salem  
Matthew Osborne  
336-462-7480  
[matthewo@cityofws.org](mailto:matthewo@cityofws.org)  
10/5/23 8:50 AM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

If this project will use any public funds for financing and/or be constructed on public owned property, Erosion Control Plan approval will need to be completed through NCDEQ - DEMLR. The contact for NCDEQ - DEMLR at the Winston-Salem Regional Office is Tamera Eplin (336-776-9800).

Stimmel Associates, PA  
Stephen Owen  
(336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
10/26/23 1:14 PM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

**9. Floodplain Development Permit**

City of Winston-Salem  
Matthew Osborne  
336-462-7480  
[matthewo@cityofws.org](mailto:matthewo@cityofws.org)  
10/5/23 8:50 AM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

There are regulated floodplain areas near the limits of this proposed project. Be aware that any proposed development in the regulated floodplain area will require approval of a Floodplain Development Permit and compliance with Winston-Salem/Forsyth Co. UDO, Chapter 8, Section 1 - Floodway and Flood Fringe Regulations. Please be mindful of this ordinance requirement as you continue with plans to develop this parcel. Application for a Floodplain Development Permit must be submitted through the electronic plan review portal as application type **04.04 Floodplain Development Permit** at the following link: <https://winston-salem.idtplans.com/secure/>

Stimmel Associates, PA  
Stephen Owen  
(336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
10/26/23 1:15 PM  
01.03) Rezoning-  
Special Use District - 2

**Fire/Life Safety**

General Issues

**13. Sketch Plans and Site Plans**

<p>City of Winston-Salem (Fire) Raven Byrd 336-747-7456 ravenb@cityofwsfire.org 10/10/23 2:39 PM 01.03) Rezoning- Special Use District - 2</p>	<p>Future construction plans shall indicate locations of fire hydrants (existing and proposed) to demonstrate compliance with fire code requirements and City development standards.</p> <p>For those buildings on this site that are equipped with sprinkler or standpipe systems, indicate the location of each FDC, ensuring no FDC is more than 100 feet from a fire hydrant.</p> <p>Ensure fire apparatus access roads are provided, designed, built and maintained in compliance with fire code requirements. These requirements include but are not limited to the following items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Design, construction and maintenance of fire apparatus access roads to carry an imposed load of not less than 75,000 pounds;</li> <li>• Clear width requirements of not less than 20 feet for two-way traffic;</li> <li>• Clear height requirements of not less than 13 feet, 6 inches;</li> <li>• Design, construction and maintenance of approved turnaround designs for fire apparatus access roads when the dead-end length of the required access road is more than 150 feet.</li> <li>• Gates may not obstruct fire apparatus access roads unless approved by the Winston-Salem Fire Department; approval requires compliance with all applicable fire code requirements.</li> </ul> <p>As part of your construction plan submittal, include the calculations for needed fire flow for this project and indicate the approved method of calculation in use. Buildings that are equipped with sprinkler systems throughout are exempt from this requirement. Refer to Section 507 of the 2018 NC Fire Code for further information. Approved calculation methods include the following options:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Appendix B of the 2018 NC Fire Code; or</li> <li>• the ISO Fire Suppression Rating Schedule (as described in <a href="https://www.isomitigation.com/siteassets/downloads/guide-determinerequiredfireflow.pdf">https://www.isomitigation.com/siteassets/downloads/guide-determinerequiredfireflow.pdf</a>).</li> </ul> <p>Emergency responder radio coverage shall meet the requirements of Section 510 of the 2018 NC Fire Code for this project. Consider how these requirements, including any systems necessary to bring radio coverage into compliance with this section, may impact your plans.</p>
<p>Stimmel Associates, PA Stephen Owen (336)7231067 sowen@stimmelpa.com 10/26/23 1:21 PM 01.03) Rezoning- Special Use District - 2</p>	<p>Acknowledged. Ex. and proposed hydrants shown on plan.</p>

**MapForsyth Addressing Team**

General Issues

**18. Addressing & Street Naming**

<p><a href="#">Forsyth County Government</a> Gloria Alford 3367032337 <a href="mailto:alfordgd@forsyth.cc">alfordgd@forsyth.cc</a> 10/18/23 9:57 AM 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2</p>	<p>Remove the hyphen out of the name Knight Wilson, approved for two words only, no hyphen. The names Bailey Club Ln and Cameron Creek Ln are approved. [ Ver. 3 ] [Edited By Gloria Alford]</p>
<p><a href="#">Stimmel Associates, PA</a> Stephen Owen (336)7231067 <a href="mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com">sowen@stimmelpa.com</a> 10/26/23 1:21 PM 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2</p>	<p>Removed.</p>

**NCDOT**

General Issues

**17. General Comments**

<p><a href="#">NCDOT Division 9</a> Ashley Long 336-747-7900 <a href="mailto:amlong1@ncdot.gov">amlong1@ncdot.gov</a> 10/16/23 12:43 PM 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The TIA has been presented for review to Scott Jones, District Engineer and JP Couch, Division Traffic Engineer.</li> </ul>
<p><a href="#">Stimmel Associates, PA</a> Stephen Owen (336)7231067 <a href="mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com">sowen@stimmelpa.com</a> 10/26/23 1:22 PM 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2</p>	<p>Acknowledged.</p>

**Planning**

General Issues

**2. COUNCIL MEMBER CONTACT**

<p><a href="#">City of Winston-Salem</a> Nick Smith 336-747-7064 <a href="mailto:nicks@cityofws.org">nicks@cityofws.org</a> 9/26/23 3:31 PM 01.11) Pre-submittal Application for Special Use-Limited District Zoning Map Amendment - 1</p>	<p><b>Please ensure that you have contacted the appropriate Council Member and/or the Community Assistance Liaison for their office prior to the Planning Board Hearing. Be advised that Council Members may want to participate in any community outreach efforts . Information for each Council Member can be found on their website here:</b> <a href="https://www.cityofws.org/564/City-Council">https://www.cityofws.org/564/City-Council</a></p>
--	--

[Stimmel Associates, PA](#) acknowledged and contacted  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/3/23 11:22 AM  
 01.11) Pre-submittal  
 Application for Special  
 Use-Limited District  
 Zoning Map  
 Amendment - 1

**12. Historic Resources**

[City of Winston-Salem](#) All of these parcels fall within the Bethania Town Lot (FY9218), which was entered onto the NC Study List for the National Register in 1991. There are known archaeological resources in this part of the Town Lot, with significant potential for new data recovery. The portions of the development in the vicinity of Joyce Avenue and Bailey Street border on Washington Town, a freedmen's community that developed after the Civil War and is anchored by Oak Grove School.  
 Heather Bratland  
 336-727-8000  
[heatherb@cityofws.org](mailto:heatherb@cityofws.org)  
 10/5/23 3:52 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

[Stimmel Associates, PA](#) Acknowledged.  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:31 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

**27. Dates to Remember**

[City of Winston-Salem](#) Issue resolution deadline is October 26.  
 Marc Allred  
 336-727-8000  
[marca@cityofws.org](mailto:marca@cityofws.org)  
 10/18/23 8:15 AM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2  
 Community Outreach Deadline is November 1.  
 Planning Board meeting is November 9 at 4:30.

[Stimmel Associates, PA](#) Acknowledged.  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:31 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

**28. Joyce Avenue Connection**

City of Winston-Salem  
 Bryan Wilson  
 336-747-7042  
[bryandw@cityofws.org](mailto:bryandw@cityofws.org)  
 10/18/23 1:16 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

Per the UDO a street connection is required to Joyce Ave. unless an engineering basis could be found as to why the connection is not viable:

5.2.71 Section A & B Residential Building, Multifamily; Townhouse; or Twin Home Use Specific Standards:

- With the exception of multifamily development located in the RSQ District, all multifamily residential buildings shall comply with the following:
  - 1. **TRAFFIC REQUIREMENTS** In approving the site plan for a multifamily development, the Planning Board shall determine that the streets, driveways, parking areas, and other public and private drives shown on the plan are so located that:
    - **a. EFFECT ON PUBLIC STREET SYSTEM They do not block, impede, or interfere with the orderly development of the public street system.**
    - **b. STANDARDS AND DEDICATION Those streets on the plan which are likely to be used by the public as through or connector streets, or which for the orderly development of the area should be made public streets, are designed to the standards of public streets and are dedicated or offered for dedication as such on a recorded plat** except that public streets in the RM-5 District may be constructed to alternative width and horizontal and vertical curvature standards, as approved by the Director of Transportation.
    - **c. ACCESS Adequate provision is made for vehicular traffic to and from the premises and for vehicular traffic and pedestrian traffic to and from the proposed buildings, structures, and parking areas on the premises, including firefighting and police equipment and personnel, ambulance service, garbage collection service, postal service, delivery service, and other public and private services and individuals who would require access to the premises.**

Stimmel Associates,  
 PA  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:31 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

Plan revised to include a street connection to Joyce Avenue

**Stormwater**

General Issues

**10. Stormwater Management Permit Required**

City of Winston-Salem  
 Joe Fogarty  
 336-747-6961  
[josephf@cityofws.org](mailto:josephf@cityofws.org)  
 10/5/23 10:29 AM  
 01.03) Rezoning-  
 Special Use District - 2

This development will be required to apply for and be issued with a Post Construction Stormwater Management permit that shows compliance with the City of Winston-Salem's Post Construction Stormwater Management ordinance provisions.

I'm assuming that this development is under the same ownership and will be developed in tandem with the "PBR 2023-21 Bethania Forest" plan. I say this as these two plans, for the purposes of a stormwater management permit review, will need to be looked at together as a "larger common plan of development" and have



one stormwater management plan approved for both of these cases combined. It appears that's what you are doing/proposing as I see notes on this W-3603 plan that indicate sharing of a stormwater management device.

The plan here states that the impervious percentage shall be 40.47% and the units/acre will be 4.81. Since these exceed 24% and 2 units/acre the plan will be considered a high density development in terms of the water quality provisions of the ordinance. I'm assuming that when the numbers for both this plan and the PBR 2023-21 plan are combined for the overall impervious percentage and units/acre in terms of looking at the larger common plan of development, then you will still exceed these thresholds. High density developments have to manage the first inch of runoff in an approved stormwater management system. Stream buffers are also required to be provided off of all intermittent and perennial streams as part of these quality provisions. You have a number of such conveyances on your development. You appear to be showing the correct buffer width of 100' for the stream on the northeastern side of the property but you should also label the one on the southern side as well for clarity

The development will create more than 20,000 sq.ft. of new impervious area and therefore it will also be subject to the quantity provisions of the ordinance. These require that the post developed peak runoff rates from the 2, 10 and 25 year storm events of minimum 6 hour duration, be managed in an approved stormwater management system to at, or below, the pre developed rates and also that the increase in the 25 year volume from the pre to the post developed condition be stored in the system and released over a 2 to 5 day period.

Your plan has a note that states "Stormwater discharge to shared device" and so I would assume you intend to use one of the devices approved as part of the PBR 2023-21 plan to also manage for this W-3603 plan. Will that one shared device on the southern side of the development be enough to capture and treat all of the runoff from the W-3603 plan? Will the area for example on the northeastern side of this proposed plan be able to be conveyed to that one shared device? I would think it may be difficult topography wise to ensure all development impervious area gets to this one shared system.

The stormwater management permit process will require a non-refundable surety to be established for the stormwater management system. In this case, where I assume it is the intent of the developer to establish a Home Owners Association (HOA) to eventually become the long term Operation and Maintenance (O&M) entity for the system, then the surety shall consist of the developer establishing an escrow account and depositing 15% of the estimated construction cost of the stormwater management system into that account and the HOA will be required to add further funds in the future. An escrow agreement will also have to be approved and entered into and once approved recorded at The Forsyth County Register of Deeds office.

Finally, an O&M Agreement for the stormwater management system will be required to be approved as part of the permit process and once approved also recorded at The Forsyth County Register of Deeds office.

**Stimmel Associates, PA**  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:32 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2

Acknowledged. Added note showing that northern portion to be managed by a second offsite shared device.

**Utilities**

General Issues

**15. General Comments**

**City of Winston-Salem**  
 Chris Jones  
 336-747-7499  
[charlesj@cityofws.org](mailto:charlesj@cityofws.org)  
 10/13/23 11:35 AM  
 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2

Submit water/sewer extension plans to Utilities Plan Review, in IDT, for permitting/approval. Water meters purchased through the COWS. System development fees due for water and wastewater at the time of meter purchase. Any existing connection not intended for reuse must be terminated at the main. No heavy fill/cut will be allowed over existing sewer lines or water lines without permission from Utilities Plan Review. Aerial crossings will not be allowed for sewer. REMINDER - All downstream sewer will need to be installed and accepted by the COWS before discharge is allowed from this phase.

**Stimmel Associates, PA**  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:34 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2

Acknowledged.

**WSDOT**

General Issues

**26. General Comments**

**Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.**  
 Regina Muncey  
 (919) 277-3100  
[regina.muncey@stantec.com](mailto:regina.muncey@stantec.com)  
 10/18/23 9:27 AM  
 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2

1. Please provide connection to Joyce Ave. WSDOT recommends 27' b-b curb and gutter w/ sidewalk along frontage to the extent possible to allow for appropriate transitions to the existing ribbon pavement section.
2. Refer to IDS for city standard cross section with curb and gutter and sidewalk on one side.
3. Refer to IDS for cul de sac and turn around details.
4. Provide ADA curb ramps for pedestrian crossing locations.

Regina Muncey - [regina.muncey@stantec.com](mailto:regina.muncey@stantec.com) - 919-349-4116  
 [ [Ver. 2](#) ] [Edited By Regina Muncey]

**Stimmel Associates, PA**  
 Stephen Owen  
 (336)7231067  
[sowen@stimmelpa.com](mailto:sowen@stimmelpa.com)  
 10/26/23 1:34 PM  
 01.03) Rezoning-Special Use District - 2

Acknowledged. Revised plan to provide Joyce Avenue Connection