

City Council – Action Request Form

Date: June 14, 2022

To: Mayor, Mayor Pro Tempore, and Members of the City Council

From: Aaron King, Assistant City Manager
Chris Murphy, Director of Planning and Development Services

Council Action Requested:
Ordinance Designating Certain Property as a Local Historic Landmark – Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House

Strategic Focus Area: Livable Neighborhoods
Strategic Objective: Preserve Historic Resources
Strategic Plan Action Item: No
Key Work Item: No



Summary of Information:

Local historic landmark designation is administered by the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission. Landmark designation is provided for by North Carolina law and signifies recognition that a property is important to the heritage and character of the community and that its protection enriches the community’s residents. To date, 141 properties in Forsyth County are so designated. The effects of landmark designation are as follows: (1) the property owner who wishes to make changes to a designated landmark must first have the plans reviewed and approved by the Historic Resources Commission; and, (2) the owner of a designed landmark may apply for an annual property tax deferral of up to 50% for as long as the property’s important historical features are retained. A designation application and report have been submitted by James Edgar Broyhill II and Melanie Pennell Broyhill for the complete exterior, interior of the house, stone walls, garage/apartment and all of the tax block and lot upon which the Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House sits, located at 525 Hawthorne Road in Winston-Salem, Tax Block 1150, Tax Lots 101C, 201. PINs 6825-59-7635 and 6825-59-6410. The tax value of the property is \$1,432,400, and the tax office will calculate the value of the tax deferral based on the amount of the property that is designated. The Historic Resources Commission held a public hearing on the application and report on May 4, 2022 and recommended approval.

Committee Action:

Committee	CDHGG 6/14/22	Action	Approval
For	Unanimous	Against	
Remarks:			

Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House

Significance Requirement

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House possesses local architectural significance due to its refined Georgian Revival-style design rendered by Charles Barton Keen's Philadelphia-based firm. The remarkably intact residence erected by McNeill Construction Company occupies a sizable prominent corner lot in the Buena Vista subdivision. Although abodes influenced by those on American and European country estates are plentiful in Winston-Salem, with Tudor, Georgian, and Classical Revival styles being the most typical throughout the city's early- to mid-twentieth-century subdivisions, the Hanes House is distinguished by its scale, sophisticated execution, and estate-like setting. The spacious dwelling encompasses a two-and-one-half-story, gable-roofed, ten-bay-wide main block; one-story, hip-roofed, three-bay north service wing; and inset northeast and south two-story porches. The exterior is characterized by white weatherboarded walls, a Ludowici-Celadon tile roof, and classical details. The slightly projecting pedimented central entrance bay, full-height paneled pilasters, carved consoles supporting the flat hood above the entrance, molded cornices, pedimented dormers, and multi-pane double-hung wood windows and French doors are hallmarks of the late Georgian style as executed in the United States during the late eighteenth century. The formal spaces—reception hall, dining room, living room, and library—feature classical cornices, door and window surrounds, and mantels. Single- and double-leaf raised-panel wood doors and wood-framed multi-pane French doors and transoms possess original hardware. Intact finishes include smooth plaster walls and ceilings, tongue-and-groove oak floors, and molded baseboards and chair rails. The nearly freestanding, half-round, curving staircase is characterized by twisted and straight cast-iron balusters capped by molded wood handrails that terminate in a spiral at the bottom. The period of significance is 1923, the dwelling's construction date.

The garage/apartment northwest of the house is original, built in 1923. It is a one-and-one-half-story, weatherboarded, three-bay garage with a second-floor apartment. Pedimented dormers pierce the side-gable green Ludowici-Celadon tile roof above a molded cornice with gable-end returns. Double-hung six-over-six wood-sash windows illuminate the apartment, which is accessed via a single-leaf six-panel wood door at the building's southeast corner. The wood-frame glazed storm door has a lattice-pattern base. The winding wood staircase empties into a short corridor adjacent to the bathroom and north and south bedrooms. The apartment retains plaster walls and ceilings, hardwood floors, baseboards with molded upper edges, simple window and door trim with mitered corners, and four-horizontal-panel doors with original brass hardware and faceted-glass knobs. One multi-pane wood casement window on each of the north, east, and south elevations lights the single garage room, which is secured by replacement roll-up metal doors with exterior faces that emulate weatherboards and a horizontal nine-pane window. The garage has a plaster ceiling and walls and a concrete floor.

The 1923 stone walls are original to the site. The lot's rolling topography necessitated the lengthy rough-face granite retaining walls that border the granite-edged concrete municipal sidewalk as well as the crescent-shaped asphalt-paved driveway. Square granite posts flank the driveway entrances. As the front lawn is at a higher grade than the house, slate-capped granite steps rise from the driveway to the lawn. The retaining walls were constructed in conjunction with the house.

A list of the character-defining features is found in the application on pages 30-32.

Integrity Requirement

The property is a significant example of Forsyth County's architecture that possesses integrity of location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

Location, Setting, Feeling and Association

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House retains high integrity of location, setting, feeling, and association, as it remains on its historic site. The 5.23-acre property provides appropriate estate-like surrounding in keeping with the dwelling's Georgian Revival-style character, thus allowing for integrity of setting, feeling, and association.

Design, Material, and Workmanship

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House retains excellent integrity in terms of design, material, and workmanship. The 1923 exterior, characterized by white weatherboarded walls, a green Ludowici-Celadon tile roof, and classical details such as the slightly projecting pedimented central entrance bay, full-height paneled pilasters, carved consoles supporting the flat hood above the entrance, molded cornices, pedimented dormers, and multi-pane double-hung wood windows and French doors remain. Modifications including the south sunporch's glazed enclosure, the enclosure of the west two-thirds of the second-story south porch to create dressing rooms, and the enclosure of the northeast porch to serve as a first-floor breakfast room and second-floor dressing room were executed in a sympathetic manner that preserves original full-height porch columns and paneled pilasters with fluted capitals as well as ornamental black wrought-iron railings with central medallions.

Most rooms in the 1923 residence maintain original volumes and finishes. The formal spaces - reception hall, dining room, living room, and library - feature classical cornices, door and window surrounds, and mantels. Single- and double-leaf raised-panel wood doors and wood-framed multi-pane French doors and transoms possess original hardware. Intact finishes include smooth plaster walls and ceilings, tongue-and-groove oak floors, and molded baseboards and chair rails. The nearly freestanding, half-round, curving staircase is characterized by twisting and straight cast-iron balusters capped by molded wood handrails that terminate in a spiral at the bottom. Service wing expansion and remodeling in 1984 and dressing room and master bathroom suite creation in 2007 were designed to minimize impact on historic fabric.