

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION	
Docket #	W-3381
Staff	Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP
Petitioner(s)	Longco Inc.
Owner(s)	Same
Subject Property	PIN # 5895-34-8992
Address	4400 Styers Ferry Road
Type of Request	Special use rezoning from HB-S to GB-S
Proposal	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from HB-S (Highway Business – special use - Agricultural Production, Crops; Agricultural Production, Livestock; Animal Feeding Operation; Fish Hatchery; Retail Store; Building Materials Supply; Convenience Store; Food or Drug Store; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Nursery, Lawn and Garden Supply Store, Retail; Storage and Salvage Yard; Services A; and Services B) to GB-S (General Business – special use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arts and Crafts Studio; Banking and Financial Services; Bed and Breakfast; Child Care, Drop-In; Church or Religious Institution, Community; Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood; Club or Lodge; College or University; Combined Use; Food or Drug Store; Funeral Home; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; Hospital or Health Center; Hotel or Motel; Institutional Vocational Training Facility; Library, Public; Manufacturing A; Micro-Brewery or Micro-Distillery; Museum or Art Gallery; Nursery, Lawn and Garden Supply Store, Retail; Offices; Recreation Facility, Public; Recreation Services, Indoor; Recreation Services, Outdoor; Restaurant (without drive-through service); Retail Store; Services A; Shopping Center; Shopping Center, Small; Special Events Center; Swimming Pool, Private; Testing and Research Lab; Theater, Indoor; Urban Agriculture; Veterinary Services; Adult Day Care Center; Child Care, Sick Children; Child Day Care Center; Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; Residential Building, Duplex; School, Private; and School, Public
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	See Attachment A for a summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach.
Zoning District Purpose Statement	The GB District is primarily intended to accommodate a wide range of retail, service, and office uses located along thoroughfares in areas which have developed with minimal front setbacks. However, the district is not intended to encourage or accommodate strip commercial development. The district would accommodate destination retail and service uses, characterized by either a larger single business use or the consolidation of numerous uses in a building or planned development,

	with consolidated access. This district is intended for application in GMAs 1, 2 and 3 and Metro Activity Centers.		
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?		
	Yes, the site fronts on a major thoroughfare within the Suburban Neighborhoods GMA and it is located adjacent to the Country Club Road/Meadowlark Drive Activity Center. The site is currently zoned HB-S.		
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION			
Location	East side of Styers Ferry Road, between Lura Road and Hollow Wood Court		
Jurisdiction	City of Winston-Salem		
Ward(s)	West		
Site Acreage	± 37.01 acres		
Current Land Use	The site is currently unoccupied and was the former location of L.A. Reynolds Garden Showcase.		
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use
	North	PB-S, HB, & GI	Various commercial, residential, and warehousing uses
	East	GI	Motor Vehicle Dismantling and Wrecking Yard
	South	RS9 & RM8-S	Undeveloped property and townhouses
	West	RS9	Undeveloped property
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?		
	The proposed mixture of uses is compatible with the commercial and industrial uses permitted on the adjacent properties located to the north and east. Some of the proposed commercial uses are less compatible with the residential uses permitted on the RM8-S and RS9 zoned properties located to the south and west.		
Physical Characteristics	The developed site has a moderate to gentle slope downward generally toward the east. The southern edge of the site is bordered by Reynolds Creek and the western property line abuts Tomahawk Creek.		
Proximity to Water and Sewer	The site has access to public water and sewer.		
Stormwater/ Drainage	The site plan shows a proposed stormwater management device to be located in the south central portion of the site. A stormwater study will be required.		
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.		

Analysis of General Site Information		The site is presently developed with multiple commercial buildings associated with a former landscaping and garden center business. The site is significantly impacted by the floodplains of both Reynolds Creek and Tomahawk Creek which converge at the eastern corner of the site.				
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3313	GI to LB	Approved 1-3-2017	±250' north	.77	Approval	Approval
F-1424	HB & RS9 to PB-S	Approved 2-28-2005	Directly northwest	1.09	Approval	Approval
F-1364	RS9 to RM8-S	Approved 6-24-2002	Directly south	28.8	Approval	Approval
F-866	HB-S & RS20 to HB-S	Approved 11-23-1987	Subject property	37.1	Approval	Approval
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION						
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D		
Styers Ferry Road	Major Thoroughfare	395'	11,000	15,300		
Fath Road	Local Street	60'	NA	NA		
Proposed Access Point(s)	The primary access to the site will be at the current driveway location onto Styers Ferry Road. There will be a gated, emergency access only connection onto Fath Road.					
Planned Road Improvements	The <i>Comprehensive Transportation Plan</i> recommends a three lane cross section with wide outside lanes, curb and gutter, and sidewalks for this section of Styers Ferry Road.					
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	<p><u>Existing Zoning: HB-S</u> 32,319 sf (based upon the latest approved site plan) / 1,000 x 36.08 [Nursery (Garden Center)] Trip Rate = 1,166 Trips per Day</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: GB-S as per the Transportation Impact Analysis</u> ±5,523 Trips per Day</p> <p><u>Trip Generation based upon the area plan recommendation of up to 18 dwelling units per acre:</u> 37.01 acres x 18 units = 666 units x 6.65 (Apartment trip rate) = 4,429 Trips per Day</p>					
Sidewalks	There are no sidewalks currently located in the area.					
Transit	Route 4 runs along Country Club Road at Vinegar Hill Road located approximately two miles to the southeast.					
Connectivity	See comments below.					
Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)	A Traffic Impact Analysis was required. See comments from WSDOT below.					

<p>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</p>	<p>The estimated trip generation from the existing zoning is approximately 1,166 trips per day compared to 5,523 trips with the proposed zoning as per the TIA. While this section of Styers Ferry Road has some degree of extra capacity, this increase in vehicular trips is significant.</p> <p>Primary access to the site would remain at its present location on Styers Ferry Road. Fath Road is a public street that stubs into the northern property line of the site. However, this street connects with Styers Ferry Road at a less than ideal location in the center of the Country Club Road/Shallowford Road intersection. Therefore, the site plan shows a gated emergency access only onto Fath Road. This is beneficial for emergency response purposes; however, it will provide limited benefit to the everyday traffic going to and from the subject property.</p> <p>Currently, traffic entering the site on Styers Ferry Road is aided by a left turn lane. However, <i>exiting</i> the site can be challenging due to roadway travel speeds and limited visibility. As recommended by the TIA and required by WSDOT and NCDOT, a right turn lane into the site with 100' of storage would be provided.</p> <p>The TIA states that the Level of Service (LOS) along this portion of Styers Ferry Road and the nearby signalized intersection with Country Club Road and Shallowford Road would decrease from a LOS D to a LOS E. The TIA recommends the signal at Styers Ferry and Country Club be optimized and retimed to reduce the delay experienced at that intersection. WSDOT will require that signal to be optimized to maintain the current LOS D after full build out of the proposed development. In addition, WSDOT recommends a condition that would require a one year bond in the amount of \$250,000. This bond could be used to mitigate transportation related issues if an accident problem occurs. The adjacent residential side streets are expected to function well within an acceptable Level of Service. The delay experienced post build is expected to be within a few seconds of the existing delay. This will be largely due to the fairly even distribution of trips both north and south on Styers Ferry Road. The developer has agreed to this condition as well as the dedication of additional right-of-way along the frontage of Styers Ferry Road and the installation of curb and gutter and sidewalks.</p>	
<p>SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS</p>		
<p>Building Square Footage</p>	<p>Square Footage</p> <p>Retail – 24,000 sf Restaurant – 9,800 sf Taproom – 2,400 sf Brewery – 6,250 sf <u>Clubhouse – 5,000 sf</u> Total = 47,450 sf Plus 229 apartments within six buildings</p>	<p>Placement on Site</p> <p>Central and western portion of the site.</p>

Units (by type) and Density	229 apartment units on 37.01 acres = 6.18 units per acre		
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout
	440 spaces	584 spaces	90° head-end
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed
	60'		One story for retail/restaurant buildings and 3/4 story split for apartment buildings
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed
	NA		30.13%
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.3 (J) General Business District Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Residential Building, Multifamily Use Conditions 		
Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3	(A) Legacy 2030 policies:	Yes	
	(B) Environmental Ord.	Yes	
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	NA	
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	<p>The site plan shows the adaptive reuse for two of the multiple buildings currently located on the site. These buildings would be repurposed for retail, restaurant, and farmer's market uses. The plan also includes the construction of six new multistory buildings. Two of these buildings would have retail/restaurant and clubhouse uses on the ground level with apartments on the upper floors. The required common recreation area would take the form of a centrally located dog park and patio area. A network of public and private greenway trails are proposed within the eastern third of the site. The tree save area is shown along both Tomahawk Creek and Reynolds Creek.</p>		
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES			
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 3 - Suburban Neighborhoods		
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Encourage redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with the surrounding area. Encourage a mixture of residential densities and housing types through land use recommendations. Promote quality design so that infill does not negatively impact surrounding development. 		
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>West Suburban Area Plan Update (2018)</i>		
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Proposed Land Use Map shows this property as a Special Land Use Condition Area (SLUCA) and recommends intermediate-density residential (8-18 Du/Ac). The specific SLUCA recommendation is as follows: "The 38-acre property containing the former L. A. Reynolds nursery development is located on the east side of Styers Ferry Road south of Shallowford Road. The property is zoned HB-S (Highway Business, Special Use). 		

	The property should be considered for future intermediate-density residential use to blend with the low-density attached residential and single-family residential developments to the south and west along Styers Ferry Road. Design recommendations for multifamily developments can be found in the Context Sensitive Multifamily Design Techniques document, available online or in the Planning and Development Services office.”
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is directly south of the Country Club Road Growth Corridor to which Fath Road connects.
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is directly west of the Country Club Road/Meadowlark Drive Activity Center.
Greenway Plan Information	The long range recommendation of the <i>Greenway Plan Update</i> is for a greenway along both Reynolds Creek (which abuts the southern side of the site) and Tomahawk Creek (which abuts the eastern side of the site). A forty (40) foot easement is therefore requested along the west side of Tomahawk Creek along the entire eastern property line. A forty (40) foot easement is also requested on the north side of Reynolds Creek. However, given the existing development on this portion of the site, the Reynolds Creek easement should begin at the easternmost parking area as shown on the submitted site plan and end at the eastern property line. Both easements shall be located twenty-five (25) feet from top-of-bank per the undisturbed buffer requirements of the stormwater ordinance. Finally, in order to provide public access to said future greenways and the greenway network, staff recommends a twenty (20) foot wide easement which would connect the streets within the development to the future greenways.
Addressing	The new internal private street name will be Mayfair Village Drive. Addresses and apartment numbers will be issued prior to permitting.
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	No
	(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?
Yes	
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	The proposed rezoning from HB-S to GB-S would convert the former site of the L.A. Reynolds Garden Showcase into a mixed use development. This would consist of 229 apartments and approximately 47,450 square feet of commercial and clubhouse uses within a total of eight buildings. The buildings would range from one story to three/four story split buildings. Open space would be in the form of a dog park, patios, and greenway trails. The <i>West Suburban Area Plan Update</i> recommends intermediate-density residential (8-18 dwelling units per acre). While the request does include a commercial component (including a restaurant) the proposed residential density at 6.18 units per acre is less than what is recommended in the

plan. The developer has agreed to conditions regarding lighting, signage, and dedication of greenway easements along both adjacent creeks.

As noted previously in the Transportation section, site access is sometimes challenging even under the present conditions. In addition, the request represents a significant increase in additional traffic compared to what could be expected under the present zoning. The Traffic Impact Analysis projects a total of 5,523 trips per day compared with approximately 1,166 trips per day with the approved site plan and uses. However, staff notes that if the site was developed at the maximum residential density of 18 units per acre as recommended in the area plan, the estimated trip generation would be +/-4,429 trips per day.

The developer will be required to construct a right turn lane along Styers Ferry Road into the site and install curb and gutter and sidewalks along the frontage. Furthermore, in order to address potential future safety issues that may arise if the request is approved, WSDOT recommends the posting of a one year bond that could be used for safety improvements should an accident problem develop. Planning staff welcomes a mixed use, walkable development at this location. Provided said bond condition for traffic safety improvements is included, staff recommends approval.

CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
The request proposes a mixture of residential and commercial uses designed within a walkable setting.	The request would add a substantial volume of additional traffic in the general area. The request (as submitted) includes limited connectivity opportunities and the location of the driveway onto Styers Ferry Road could be problematic due to roadway travel speeds and limited visibility.
The proposed residential density of 6.18 units per acre is lower than the maximum of 18 units per acre recommended in the area plan.	
The site has been commercially zoned and used for many years.	
The site is separated from the adjacent townhomes located to the south by Reynolds Creek.	
The site fronts along a major thoroughfare and improvements along Styers Ferry Road will be required.	

SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
 - a. Developer shall obtain a Floodplain Development Permit from the Erosion Control staff.
 - b. If required based upon final site survey, developer shall apply for a bufferyard width variance from the City of Winston-Salem Zoning Board of Adjustment.
 - c. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the

Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.

- d. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from NCDOT and the City of Winston-Salem; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit. Required improvements include:
 - Dedicate forty (40) feet of right-of-way from the centerline of Styers Ferry Road.
 - Install right turn lane, curb and gutter, and sidewalk along Styers Ferry Road.

• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**

- a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Elevation A” as verified by Planning staff.
- b. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections for the proposed lighting demonstrating the use of full-cut off fixtures, light height of 25' or less and no more than 0.5 foot-candles at the property line.
- c. The developer shall be required to post a bond with the City of Winston-Salem in the amount of \$250,000 to be used to address potential traffic safety issues along the site’s frontage on Styers Ferry Road. Said bond shall be approved by the City of Winston-Salem. The entire \$250,000 may be paid in its entirety prior to any building permits being issued. The developer may also make a payment toward the \$250,000 total, proportionate to the building permit being requested. The amount of the payment shall be determined by calculating the number of estimated vehicular trips directly associated with the corresponding building permit (for reference, the total number of estimated trips noted in the TIS is 5,523). The developer shall be required to submit a detailed summary of the estimated number of trips with each building permit. Said summary shall be sealed by the professional engineer responsible for drafting the TIS associated with case W-3381. The entire \$250,000 bond shall remain in place for a period of one (1) year beginning with the date the last Certificate of Occupancy for the subject property has been issued. The applicant for the final building permit shall be responsible for payment of the outstanding balance that remains between the amount of bond money collected by the City up to that point and \$250,000. The bond shall be required to be renewed annually until the one (1) year time period described above has expired.

• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**

- a. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.
- b. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.
- c. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit
- d. Freestanding signage shall be limited to one sign on the northern side of the Styers Ferry Road entrance with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of thirty-six (36) square feet and one sign on the southern side of said entrance with a with a maximum height of eight (8) feet and a maximum copy area of fifty (50) square feet.

- e. Developer shall dedicate forty (40) foot wide greenway easements along both Reynolds Creek and Tomahawk Creek and a twenty (20) foot wide connection easement as shown on the site plan.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-3381
AUGUST 9, 2018**

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

Aaron King read into the record “W-3381 Revised Conditions.”

Aaron also discussed transportation issues and the \$250,000 bond that has been established as transportation is monitored throughout site progression.

Jeff Fansler with WSDOT answered questions in regards to the timetable of the beltway and turning issues, and also maintenance of the bond by WSDOT.

Discussion was also had pertaining to the building being located in a floodplain, according to the location map.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the zoning petition and certified that the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all UDO requirements if the petition is approved.

SECOND: Chris Leak

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Tommy Hicks, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Johnny Sigers, Brenda Smith

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Chris Murphy, AICP
Acting Director of Planning and Development Services