

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION	
Docket #	W-3424
Staff	Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP
Petitioner(s)	The Salvation Army
Owner(s)	Same
Subject Property	PINs 6834-29-6427 and 6834-29-6332
Address	1411 and 1419 South Broad Street
Type of Request	Special Use rezoning from RS9 to RM8-S
Proposal	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Map for the subject property from RS9 (Residential, Single Family – 9,000 sf minimum lot size) to RM8-S (Residential, Multifamily – 8 units per acre maximum density – Special Use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child Day Care Center; Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Triplex; Residential Building, Townhouse; and Residential Building, Twinhome
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.
Zoning District Purpose Statement	The RM8 District is primarily intended to accommodate duplexes, twin homes, townhouses, multifamily, and other low intensity multifamily uses at a maximum overall density of eight (8) units per acre. This district is appropriate for GMAs 2 and 3 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services are available.
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	<p>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?</p> <p>Yes, the site is located along a minor thoroughfare, close to a public park, and it is within GMA 2.</p>
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION	
Location	East side of South Broad Street across from Bond Street
Jurisdiction	City of Winston-Salem
Ward(s)	South
Site Acreage	± 2.07 acres
Current Land Use	The site is developed with an institutional building and associated parking. The Salvation Army has relocated its administrative offices which were once located on the site; however, they maintain a service presence at the site for their community disaster and music ministries.

Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District	Use			
	North	RS9	Undeveloped property with an access to a commercial use			
	East	LI and LB-S	Dize Company (awnings and tents)			
	South	RS9	Undeveloped property			
	West	RS9	Single-family homes and a transmission tower			
Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?					
	Yes. Due to the existing nature of the institutional building proposed for the Child Day Care Center use, and the relatively modest scale and placement of the proposed residential buildings, the proposed uses are generally compatible with the uses permitted on the adjacent properties.					
Physical Characteristics	The developed site is generally flat but does have some steep topography sloping downward along the northeastern and eastern edges of the site. There are several mature trees within these undeveloped areas as well.					
Proximity to Water and Sewer	Both public water and sewer service are located within South Broad Street in front of the site.					
Stormwater/ Drainage	Due to the limited extent of grading and new impervious coverage, the site is exempt from managing both stormwater quantity and quality.					
Watershed and Overlay Districts	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.					
Historic, Natural Heritage and/or Farmland Inventories	This property abuts the Washington Park National Register Historic District (listed in 1992) along the southern boundary.					
Analysis of General Site Information	The subject property is developed with an institutional building and associated parking. While it is generally flat, the eastern edge of the site has some steep topography and some large mature trees. The site is positioned well above the regulatory floodplain of Salem Creek to the north.					
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3205	RS9 to RS7	Approved 12/16/2013	150 feet west	.17	Approval	Approval
W-2923	MU-S Site Plan Amendment	Approved 4/16/2007	150 feet north	23.67	Approval	Approval
W-935	RS9 to LB-S	Approved 4/5/1982	Directly southeast	.41	Approval	Approval

SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION				
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D
South Broad Street	Minor Thoroughfare	329 feet	6,400	13,800
Proposed Access Point(s)	The site plan shows two existing driveways from South Broad Street, which will be widened and relocated slightly to the north.			
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	<p><u>Existing Zoning: RS9 (Based upon the most recent use)</u> $9,750 / 1,000 \times 9.11$ (Church Trip Rate) = 89 Trips per Day</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: RM8-S</u> $[16 \text{ units} \times 6.65 \text{ (Apartment Trip Rate)}] + [9,750 / 1,000 \times 79.26 \text{ (Day Care Center Trip Rate)}] =$ 855 Total Trips per Day</p>			
Sidewalks	Sidewalk is located along South Broad Street.			
Transit	WSTA route 85 serves South Broad Street in front of the subject property.			
Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information	The site has frontage on a minor thoroughfare which has ample capacity. The site is also served by sidewalks and transit. The site plan proposes minor modifications to the existing driveways. Staff does not anticipate any transportation-related issues associated with this request.			
SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS				
Building Square Footage	Square Footage		Placement on Site	
	9,750 for the Child Day Care Center and 14,400 for the Residential Building, Multifamily		Southern and eastern areas	
Units (by type) and Density	16 units on 2.07 acres = 7.7 units per acre			
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout	
	60 spaces	66 spaces	90-degree head-in	
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed	
	60 feet		One story for the day care (existing building) and three stories for the residential buildings	
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed	
	80 percent		45 percent	
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (L) RM8 Residential Multifamily District Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.18 Child Day Care Center Use Conditions Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Residential Building, Multifamily Use Conditions 			

Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3	(A) Legacy 2030 policies:	Yes
	(B) Environmental Ord.	N/A
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	N/A
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	The site plan illustrates the adaptive reuse of the former Salvation Army church and office into a Child Day Care Center. Also proposed are two, three-story multifamily residential buildings. The existing parking and circulation area would be modified and expanded by adding approximately 24 spaces. The Tree Save Area is shown in the northeastern corner of the site, and the majority of the playground area for the Child Day Care Center is shown in the southeastern area. Due to various site constraints and programming requirements, the dumpster is proposed to abut the South Broad Street side of the building. The petitioner has agreed to provide additional wall and screening treatments to address the visual impact of this placement. The site plan complies with UDO requirements.	
CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES		
Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 2 - Urban Neighborhoods	
Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encourage a mixture of residential densities and housing types through land use recommendations. • Promote compatible infill development that fits with the context of its surroundings. • Encourage redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with the surrounding area. • Encourage the development of a range of childcare facilities. 	
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan Update (2014)</i>	
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Proposed Land Use Map shows the majority of the subject property for institutional land use and the northern lot (PIN 6834-29-6427) for single-family residential use. 	
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is not located along a growth corridor.	
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is not located within an activity center.	
Addressing	The proposed parking arrangement and building placement will require two internal private street names. These names will be approved by MapForsyth prior to the issuance of building permits.	

Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)	(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	No
	(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?
	Yes
Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	<p>The request to rezone this developed tract from RS9 to RM8-S would accommodate a Child Day Care Center and 16 residential units. The site is located along the northern edge of the Washington Park neighborhood and has a long history of institutional use.</p> <p>The site also fronts on a minor thoroughfare with ample capacity and access to sidewalks and transit. The property adjoins LI and LB-S property to the east and GI and MU-S properties approximately 100 feet to the north.</p> <p>The request is consistent with the institutional land use recommendation of the area plan with regard to its Child Day Care Center aspect. Regarding the multifamily component, it should be noted that it is not possible to anticipate or plan for every future development scenario for a particular site. However, within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA, <i>Legacy</i> recommends a mixture of residential densities and housing types when compatible with the surrounding development pattern.</p> <p>Given the specific setting of the subject property and the modest scale of the residential units proposed (contained within two separate buildings), the request is a contextually sensitive and reasonable approach to infill development.</p>
CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION	
Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
The request is consistent with the RM8 district purpose statement.	The area plan recommends institutional and single-family residential land uses for the subject property.
The site is a good location for residential infill in that it abuts a minor thoroughfare, is served by sidewalks and transit, and is bordered by a significant amount of nonresidential uses and zoning.	
The proposed day care would be located in a building that has a history of institutional use.	
Some of the mature trees in the northeastern corner of the site will be included within the Tree Save Area.	
No additional access points are proposed.	

SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are based upon interdepartmental review comments and are intended to ensure compliance with established standards and/or reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
 - a. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem. Additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of the driveway permit.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
 - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.
 - b. The internal street names shall be approved by MapForsyth.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE(S) OF OCCUPANCY:**
 - a. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.
 - b. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.
- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
 - a. Freestanding signage shall be limited to one monument sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of eighteen (18) square feet. No signs shall be internally illuminated.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations are made by the City-County Planning Board, and final action is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, continue, or request modifications to any proposal. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE PROPOSAL IS CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND/OR THE ELECTED BODY.**

CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES FOR W-3424 OCTOBER 10, 2019

Desmond Corley presented the staff report.

George Bryan asked about how the flow of drop-off and pick-up traffic for the child day care center will work and how that will affect the flow of traffic on Broad Street. George also inquired as to whether the parking area was shared with the proposed apartments.

Desmond stated that the parking area was shared between the residential and day care uses.

[Brice Shearburn, 406 Granville Drive, Winston-Salem, NC 27101, spoke on behalf of the petitioner.]

- The site plan we prepared shows separate parking calculations for the residential and day care uses. Typically, when you undertake parking assessments and traffic flow based upon the standard engineering guides, you end up with inflated numbers. This is not a day care that allows circulation of pickup and drop-off; this is an early childhood education facility, similar to others that are operated and maintained by the same operator, Family Services. It has 108 students. The parents are required to come onto the site, park their cars and walk their children in. This is not a staged arrival, this is a classroom condition. What we find in discussions with their staff is that you will find one family member conveying multiple children. There are also other means of these children accessing these programs via community vehicle. The traffic counts shown based upon the engineering guidelines appear to be extremely overstated.
- Our analysis suggests that there will probably be, in the morning cycle, less than 75 trips based upon the relationship or the ratio between cars and kids and cars. Very few of these are one child per car.
- With respect to the residential uses, we have designed and developed the parking ratio as required in the building code to meet those residential needs. There is in fact a surplus of parking. The day care requirement is 60 and we're providing 66. We have met the obligation with respect to the residential.
- We are trying to create an affordable housing element in a GMA 2 zone that is transit-center driven, there is a bus line. We are looking at service employees, populations that are now underserved, and quality housing.
- Broad Street does have a surplus of trip amounts, and the DOT's recent move to put a traffic signal at the corner of Salem Avenue and Broad Street, we think, enhances and improves the traffic and transportation flow.

George asked Desmond if he agreed with that traffic analysis as compared to what is in the report.

Desmond stated that trips per day or trips in the peak hour appearing in the staff report are taken from the industry standard manual, and staff is using whatever their calculation standards are.

Jack Steelman commended the petitioner for their creativity in providing a way for working parent to live in this area and have the ability to walk their child to day care.

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved that the Planning Board find that the request is consistent with the comprehensive plan.

SECOND: Tommy Hicks

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan; Melynda Dunigan; Jason Grubbs; Tommy Hicks; Clarence Lambe; Chris Leak; Brenda Smith; Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended approval of the zoning petition and certified the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all code requirements if the petition is approved.

SECOND: Tommy Hicks

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan; Melynda Dunigan; Jason Grubbs; Tommy Hicks; Clarence Lambe; Chris Leak; Brenda Smith; Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Aaron King
Director of Planning and Development Services