

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
STAFF REPORT**

<b>PETITION INFORMATION</b>	
<b>Docket #</b>	W-3366
<b>Staff</b>	Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP
<b>Petitioner(s)</b>	Dominion Building, LLC
<b>Owner(s)</b>	Same
<b>Subject Property</b>	PIN#s 6823-51-5704 and 6823-51-5917
<b>Address</b>	The undeveloped site does not have an address assignment.
<b>Type of Request</b>	Special use rezoning from MU-S (Two Phase) to RM12-S
<b>Proposal</b>	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property <b>from</b> MU-S (Mixed Use – special use – Two Phase - (Residential Building, Multifamily; Arts and Crafts Studio; Food or Drug Store; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Retail Store; Restaurant (Without Drive-Through Service); Restaurant (With Drive-Thru Service); Wholesale Trade A; Wholesale Trade B; Building Contractor, Heavy; Shopping Center; Banking and Financial Services; Offices; Services, A; Services, B; Storage Services, Retail; Recreation Services, Indoor; Child Care Institution; Child Day Care Center; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; School, Private; School, Vocational or Professional; Manufacturing A; Testing and Research Laboratory; and Veterinary Services) <b>to</b> RM12-S (Residential, Multifamily – 12 dwelling units per acre maximum density - special use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Single Family; and Planned Residential Development</li> </ul>
<b>Neighborhood Contact/Meeting</b>	<p>According to the petitioner’s representative Davis Ray: “On March 23, 2018 we sent out a letter (Attachment A) to a total of 19 neighbors (address list also Attachment A) in the community to explain our proposed development and rezoning on the property located off Stafford Village Boulevard in Winston-Salem, NC. There was only one response from Kerry. E Howard (2450 Jay Avenue, Winston-Salem, NC 27127) to ask a question about an existing easement on her property. Since Mrs. Howard’s property is adjacent to ours she was inquiring if our development would have any impact on her property. I explained to her that our designed plans did not have any impact on the easement she was referring to. Additionally, she asked if our firm had any interest in purchasing her property (Forsyth County, NC PIN: 6823-51-3070.00) and I explained to her that we would have an interest in speaking with her at a later date in reference to her property. Other than Mrs. Howard, there were no additional calls or feedback received by our office.”</p>
<b>Zoning District Purpose Statement</b>	<p>The RM12 District is primarily intended to accommodate multifamily uses at a maximum overall density of twelve (12) units per acre. This district is appropriate for GMAs 1, 2, and 3 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water</p>

	and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services, are available.		
<b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b>	<b>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?</b>		
	Yes, the proposed residential density is less than twelve units per acre and the site is located within an activity center with good access and within close proximity to retail services.		
<b>GENERAL SITE INFORMATION</b>			
<b>Location</b>	South side of Stafford Village Boulevard, east of Stafford Place Boulevard		
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	City of Winston-Salem		
<b>Ward(s)</b>	South		
<b>Site Acreage</b>	± 11.10 acres		
<b>Current Land Use</b>	The site is currently undeveloped.		
<b>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</b>	<b>Direction</b>	<b>Zoning District</b>	<b>Use</b>
	North	RS9 & MRB-S	Undeveloped property
	East	MRB-S	Walmart Super Center
	South	RS9	Undeveloped property
	West	MU-S	Three story apartments
<b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b>	<b>(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?</b>		
	Yes, the proposed apartments are compatible with the existing apartments located to the west and the large scale retail development located to the east.		
<b>Physical Characteristics</b>	The site is heavily wooded and it is characterized by moderate to steep topography sloping downward toward two small streams which traverse the site.		
<b>Proximity to Water and Sewer</b>	The site has access to public water and sewer.		
<b>Stormwater/ Drainage</b>	The proposed site plan shows multiple stormwater discharges directly into said existing streams. In order to be exempt from providing a stormwater management facility on the site, the developer has agreed to a condition that the adjacent 2.68 acre tract located to the west across Stafford Place Boulevard, will remain undeveloped. A stormwater study will still be required.		
<b>Watershed and Overlay Districts</b>	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.		
<b>Analysis of General Site Information</b>	The subject property is undeveloped and heavily wooded with mature trees and undergrowth. Two ravines with small streams traverse through the site as does a public sanitary sewer line in the eastern portion of the site. The site is not located within a designated watershed and it does not include any regulatory floodplains.		

RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3215	RS9 to RM18-S	Approved 5-5-2014	Directly southwest	9.70	Approval	Approval
W-3131	MU-S Site Plan Amendment	Approved 2-6-2012	Directly west	22.07	Approval	Approval
W-2964	RS9 to MU-S Two Phase	Approved 2-4-2008	Included current site	36.09	Approval	Approval
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION						
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D		
Stafford Village Boulevard	Major Thoroughfare	588'	10,000	15,800		
Stafford Place Boulevard	Local Street	644'	NA	NA		
<b>Proposed Access Point(s)</b>	The site plan includes one connection onto Stafford Place Boulevard.					
<b>Planned Road Improvements</b>	As per conditions of the original rezoning approval, development of the subject property will necessitate the installation of a traffic signal at the intersection of Stafford Village Boulevard and Stafford Place Boulevard.					
<b>Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed</b>	<p><u>Existing Zoning: MU-S Two Phase based upon a hypothetical mixture of uses with building square footages shown on the approved site plan</u></p> <p><u>Offices</u> – 33,000 sf / 1,000 x 11.01 (General Office Building Trip Rate) = 363 Trips per Day +</p> <p><u>Bank</u> – 7,600 sf / 1,000 x 12.13 (Walk In Bank Trip Rate) = 92 Trips per Day +</p> <p><u>Restaurants</u> – 13,000 sf / 1,000 x 89.95 (Quality Restaurant Trip Rate) = 1,169 Trips per Day +</p> <p><u>Retail</u> – 25,500 sf / 1,000 x 44.32 (Specialty Center Trip Rate) = 1,130 Trips per Day = ±2,754 Total Trips per Day</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: RM12-S</u></p> <p>96 units x 6.65 (Apartment trip rate) = 638 Trips per Day</p>					
<b>Sidewalks</b>	Sidewalks are currently located along both public street frontages of the subject property. The site plan includes two lateral connections between said public sidewalks and the internal network of sidewalks.					
<b>Transit</b>	Routes 83 and 101 serve the nearby Walmart with the bus stop located approximately 1,200 feet to the east.					
<b>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</b>	The approved site plan for the subject property shows a mixture of commercial, office, restaurant, and banking uses consisting of approximately 79,100 square feet. As noted above, the estimated traffic generation for said existing zoning is greater than four times the level of trips which are projected with the proposed apartment development.					

	Staff also notes that Stafford Village Boulevard has ample capacity and the site is within walking distance of many basic services. Based upon a previously approved condition, the developer will be responsible for installing a traffic signal at the intersection of Stafford Village Boulevard and Stafford Place Boulevard.		
<b>SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS</b>			
<b>Building Square Footage</b>	<b>Square Footage</b>		<b>Placement on Site</b>
	±117,432 sf for the apartment buildings + 1,692 sf for the community center = 119,124 total sf		Western and Central portion of the site
<b>Units (by type) and Density</b>	96 apartment units on 11.1 acres = 8.65 dwelling units per acre		
<b>Parking</b>	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Layout</b>
	174 spaces	192 spaces	90° head-end
<b>Building Height</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	45'		Three story
<b>Impervious Coverage</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	75%		26.84%
<b>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (M) RM12 Residential Multifamily District</li> <li>Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Residential Building, Multifamily Use Conditions</li> </ul>		
<b>Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3</b>	<b>(A) Legacy 2030 policies:</b>	Yes	
	<b>(B) Environmental Ord.</b>	NA	
	<b>(C) Subdivision Regulations</b>	NA	
<b>Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements</b>	The proposed site plan shows four, three story apartment buildings and a one story community center with a playground area. A common green is of approximately 13,876 square feet located in the center of the project. The required recreational square footage is 9,600 square feet. The plan includes a good network of sidewalks and the required Tree Save area is located along the eastern border of the site adjacent to one of the small streams.		
<b>CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES</b>			
<b>Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area</b>	Growth Management Area 3 - Suburban Neighborhoods		
<b>Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Facilitate land use patterns that offer a variety of housing choices.</li> <li>Activity centers have the potential to accommodate denser mixed-use development.</li> <li>Good mixed-use design for activity center development or redevelopment ensures attractive, usable, durable, and adaptable places. Mixed-use developments need to be compatible with adjacent</li> </ul>		

	land uses, provide a diversity of housing types, contribute to the character of the neighborhood and larger community, and create vibrant, pedestrian-oriented places. Special attention needs to be given to producing an acceptable mix of land uses; designing parking areas for walkability; providing circulation patterns for vehicular, pedestrian, and bicycle access; and providing public amenities including plazas and open space.
<b>Relevant Area Plan(s)</b>	<i>South Suburban Area Plan Update (2017)</i>
<b>Area Plan Recommendations</b>	<p>The property is located within the Peters Creek Activity Center and is shown for commercial land use. Activity Centers may also include a housing component, especially in suburban areas where new activity centers are being proposed. It is important to install sidewalk connections throughout activity centers to encourage pedestrian connections between uses.</p> <p><u>Specific Peters Creek Activity Center Recommendations:</u>  The Peters Creek Activity Center contains approximately 230 acres and is located along Stafford Village Boulevard between Peters Creek Parkway (NC 150) and Old Salisbury Road. This activity center serves all of the South Suburban Planning Area in addition to northern Davidson County. An intermediate-density multifamily development has been constructed west of the retail area along Stafford Village Boulevard. New development in this activity center should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A mixture of residential densities along the southern and western portions of the activity center.</li> <li>• Developments should have a pedestrian-oriented urban form with buildings placed near the street, on-street public parking, and private parking located to the rear and sites of buildings.</li> <li>• Uses should be linked to each other and adjoining properties with vehicular and pedestrian connections.</li> </ul>
<b>Site Located Along Growth Corridor?</b>	The site is not located along a growth corridor.
<b>Site Located within Activity Center?</b>	The site is located within the Peters Creek Activity Center.
<b>Addressing</b>	The proposed new internal street name of Stafford Place Circle has been approved. Building floor plans will need to be submitted prior to permitting for addresses to be issued.
<b>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</b>	<b>(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?</b>
	No
	<b>(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Legacy 2030</i>?</b>
	Yes
<b>Analysis of Conformity to Plans and</b>	The proposed rezoning from MU-S Two Phase to RM12-S would allow for the construction of 96 apartment units on an undeveloped, topographically challenging site. While the <i>South Suburban Area Plan</i>

<b>Planning Issues</b>	<p><i>Update</i> recommends commercial land use for the site, this recommendation is based upon the approved MU-S zoning and site plan which includes a mixture of retail, service, and office uses.</p> <p>Planning staff notes that the subject property is located between three story apartment buildings and a Walmart Super Center. The site also fronts along a major thoroughfare which has excess capacity. Transit is located within walking distance. The property located directly to the south of the site is undeveloped. In light of these site specific characteristics, staff sees the subject property (which is also located within an activity center) as being a favorable location for intermediate or even high density residential development. Staff also notes that the steep and variable topography of the subject property would seem to be problematic for commercial development. Staff recommends approval.</p>
------------------------	---

**CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION**

<b>Positive Aspects of Proposal</b>	<b>Negative Aspects of Proposal</b>
The request is compatible with the surrounding development pattern.	The area plan recommends commercial land use for the site.
The estimated traffic generation is significantly less than what could be anticipated under the current zoning.	
The site is located within an activity center.	
The site is a convenient location for apartments within walking distance to a variety of retail and commercial services including two grocery stores.	
The site is served with sidewalks.	
The site is within walking distance to transit service.	

**SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  - a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment. Developer shall submit a Staff Change request for PIN# 6823-42-9009 denoting said PIN# to remain undeveloped.
  - b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit. Required improvements include:
    - Installation of a traffic signal at the intersection of Stafford Village Boulevard and Stafford Place Boulevard.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  - a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Elevation A” as verified by Planning staff.
  - b. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections for the proposed lighting demonstrating the use of full-cut off fixtures, light height of 25' or less and no more than 0.5 foot-candles at the property line.
  
- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
  - a. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.
  - b. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.
  - c. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.
  - d. Developer shall install Large Variety Street trees along Stafford Place Boulevard as shown on site plan.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval**

**NOTE:** These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

---

---

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
PUBLIC HEARING  
MINUTES FOR W-3366  
APRIL 12, 2018**

Aaron King presented the staff report.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

**WORK SESSION**

During discussion by the Planning Board, a question was asked as to:

How would stormwater be handled on this site given the topography and the streams?  
Aaron King replied that given their impervious coverage is below 24%, a lot of what is being captured is allowed to be discharged directly into those streams that are on site.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the rezoning petition and certified the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all UDO requirements if the petition is approved.

SECOND: Jason Grubbs

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Jason Grubbs, Tommy Hicks, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Johnny Sigers, Brenda Smith

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

---

A. Paul Norby, FAICP  
Director of Planning and Development Services