

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
STAFF REPORT**

PETITION INFORMATION	
Docket	W-3651
Staff	Dan Roberts
Petitioner(s)	Twelve Star Express Inc.
Owner(s)	Twelve Star Express Inc.
Subject Property	6844-04-4216
Address	1035 East Clemmons ville Road
Type of Request	Special Use District Rezoning
Proposal	<p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Map for the subject property from RS9 (Residential, Single Family, 9,000 minimum lot size) to PB-S (Pedestrian Business – Special Use). The petitioner is requesting the following uses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Arts and Crafts Studio; Convenience Store; Food or Drug Store; Furniture and Home Furnishings Store; Micro-Brewery or Micro-Distillery; Restaurant (without drive through service); Retail Store; Shopping Center, Small; Banking and Financial Services; Veterinary Services; Recreation Services, Indoor; Offices; Services, A; Combined Use; Government Offices, Neighborhood Organization, or Post Office; Museum or Art Gallery; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Duplex
Neighborhood Contact/Meeting	A summary of the petitioner’s neighborhood outreach is attached.
Zoning District Purpose Statement	The PB district is primarily intended to accommodate office, retail, service, institutional, and high-density residential uses which customarily serve community and convenience business needs of smaller communities and urban nodes in the City and County. This district is intended for application in Growth Management Areas 1, 2 and 3.
Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?
	Yes, the site is located in GMA 2 and can accommodate retail and services for nearby residential neighborhoods.
GENERAL SITE INFORMATION	
Location	Northeast intersection of Thomasville Road and East Clemmons ville Road.
Jurisdiction	Winston-Salem
Ward(s)	Southeast
Site Acreage	± 4.53 acres

Current Land Use	The site previously contained a convenience store on the southern section of the parcel, which was removed by NCDOT to create additional right-of-way for the I-40 and NC 109 interchange improvement project. The northern section of the parcel remains undeveloped and wooded.					
Surrounding Property Zoning and Use	Direction	Zoning District			Use	
	North	RS9			Single-family homes	
	East	RS9			Single-family homes	
	South	RS9			Single-family homes	
	West	RS9			Single-family homes	
Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?					
	The subject property is surrounded by residential zoning on all sides and previously contained a legally non-conforming commercial use. The proposed uses are mostly neighborhood serving business uses oriented in a way which minimizes their impact on nearby residents.					
Physical Characteristics	The southern section of the site is located at the angled intersection of Thomasville and East Clemmons Roads, where a convenience store previously operated but has now been removed. The northern portion of the site is wooded and undeveloped. The site is generally flat with a slight increase in elevation from south to north. The parcel has sufficient frontage along both Thomasville Road and East Clemmons Road to allow multiple access points into the site.					
Proximity to Water and Sewer	Public water and sewer are available from both Thomasville Road and East Clemmons Road.					
Stormwater/ Drainage	No known stormwater or drainage issues exist on-site. The site plan calls for a stormwater control device at the southern edge of the parcel.					
Analysis of General Site Information	The site is surrounded by single-family development and this proposal would introduce a broader range of commercial uses than previously existed on the subject property. The northern half of the property is currently wooded, but the site does not appear to have any other major developmental constraints.					
RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
W-3162	PB-S Site Plan Amendment	Approved 12/3/2012	1,600 ft Northeast	1.12	Approval	Approval
W-2971	RS9 to PB-S	Approved 5/5/2008	1,300 ft Northeast	.23	Approval	Approval

SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION					
Street Name	Classification	Maintenance	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D
Thomasville Road	Major Thoroughfare	NCDOT	695 feet	6,400	11,600
East Clemmons ville Road	Minor Thoroughfare	WSDOT	265 feet	12,000	11,600
Proposed Access Point(s)	The site plan proposes two access points. The main entrance to the development will be on Thomasville Road, with a secondary entrance on East Clemmons ville Road.				
Proposed Road Improvements	DOT is requiring left and right turn lanes at the Thomasville Road access point, with a minimum of 50 feet of storage at each entrance.				
Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed	<p><u>Existing Zoning: RS9</u> 4.53 acres x 43,560 sf / 9,000 sf = 21 potential lots x 9.57 (SFR Trip Rate) = 200 trips per day</p> <p><u>Proposed Zoning: PB-S</u> The TIA indicates an average daily traffic volume of 3,960 vehicles.</p>				
Sidewalks	Sidewalks will be installed along the entire Thomasville Road frontage and the western portion of the East Clemmons ville Road frontage as part of the NCDOT improvement project. Internal sidewalks are also proposed throughout the property.				
Transit	This parcel is serviced by WSTA Route 86 which stops on Thomasville Road to the southwest of the property. This route has been temporarily rerouted while intersection improvements are being constructed.				
Connectivity	The site's internal streets form a circulation system that connect all proposed buildings and parking areas to each other and to adjacent rights-of-way.				
Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)	The TIA states that the proposed mixed-use development is not expected to have a significant impact on the adjacent transportation network and does not recommend any turn lanes. However, NCDOT disagrees and is requiring construction of both left and right turn lanes on Thomasville Road.				
Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information	The site has approximately 960 feet of combined frontage along Thomasville Road and East Clemmons ville Road, with one access point on each road. NCDOT is requiring left and right turn lanes with at least 50 feet of storage at the Thomasville Road access. The East Clemmons ville Road access will be limited to right-in/right-out movements only.				

	<p>The Traffic Impact Analysis estimates a daily average of 3,960 trips will be generated by the proposed development. Although the TIA concludes that no turn lanes are necessary, NCDOT will require them for safety and operational reasons. Sidewalks will be installed along both Thomasville Road and Clemmons Road as part of NCDOT’s intersection improvement project and the site plan includes internal pedestrian connections.</p> <p>WSTA Route 86 stops on Thomasville Road adjacent to the site. The proposed site design features an internal circulation system that promotes effective traffic flow and connectivity.</p>		
SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS			
Building Square Footage	Square Footage	Placement on Site	
	29,450 square feet distributed across 8 buildings	The retail buildings are spread throughout the site and generally form a circle around a central, interior parking area.	
Units (by type) and Density	There are no residential buildings shown on the site plan.		
Parking	Required	Proposed	Layout
	102	102	90 Degree Parking
Building Height	Maximum		Proposed
	60’		One- or two-story buildings
Impervious Coverage	Maximum		Proposed
	No Limit		47%
UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request	Section 4.6.6 – PB Pedestrian Business District Section 5.2.82 – Shopping Center, Small (W) Use-Specific Standards Chapter 6 – Development Standards		
Complies with Section 3.2.11	(A) Forward 2045 policies:	Yes	
	(B) Environmental Ord.	N/A	
	(C) Subdivision Regulations	N/A	
Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements	The site plan proposes 8 buildings totaling 29,450 square feet. A variety of uses are proposed including convenience store and retail store, which are both shown on the site plan. These uses are configured in the form of a small shopping center.		
	The applicant has proposed a Type III Buffer yard between the northern boundary line and Split Oak Drive to minimize impacts of the site on adjacent residential development. A fence or wall option may be used to substitute for plantings between the parking area and the 15’ alley in the northeast portion of the site.		
	The site plan meets all use-specific standards for Shopping Center, Small and all UDO requirements.		

CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES	
Forward 2045 Growth Management Area	Growth Management Area 2 – Urban Neighborhoods
Relevant Forward 2045 Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a mix of uses along growth corridors to support an enhanced transit and pedestrian network. • Prioritize and potentially incentivize denser, mixed-use, urban development patterns closer to the city center and along growth corridors as an alternative to greenfield development. • Prioritize neighborhood-serving uses, such as cafés, medical offices, and grocery stores, instead of large-scale commercial uses, near residential areas.
Relevant Area Plan(s)	<i>Southeast Winston-Salem Area Plan Update</i> (2013)
Area Plan Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Proposed Land Use Map recommends the subject property for mixed use development. • Encourage and support the redevelopment/rehabilitation of existing older/underutilized commercial and industrial sites. • Locate parking areas internally, so they may be shared by the mixture of uses on site, and design them to be visually unobtrusive and pedestrian-friendly. • Protect residential areas from inappropriate commercial encroachment.
Site Located Along Growth Corridor?	The site is located along the Thomasville Road Growth Corridor.
Site Located within Activity Center?	The site is not located within an Activity Center.
Comprehensive Transportation Plan Information	The <i>Comprehensive Transportation Plan</i> calls for the intersection of NC 109/Thomasville Road and I-40 to be redeveloped as a split-diamond interchange. Improvements to Clemmons Road and Thomasville Road are underway as part of this project.
Rezoning Consideration from Section 3.2.19 A 16	Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?
	Yes – the installation of a roundabout to replace the existing intersection at Thomasville Road and East Clemmons Road will prepare the site to accommodate additional traffic volume.
	Is the requested action in conformance with <i>Forward 2045</i>?
	Yes

Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues	This request would rezone approximately 4.53 acres on the north side of the Thomasville Road and East Clemmons Road intersection for a small neighborhood shopping center. This intersection is currently being improved by NCDOT as part of the reconstruction of the Thomasville Road/I-40 interchange. Internal connectivity improvements, both for vehicles and pedestrians, are also included in the proposed site plan, including turn lanes on Thomasville Road.	
	The <i>Southeast Winston-Salem Area Plan Update</i> (2013) recommends a mixture of uses for this property, which could include a range of office, commercial, residential, institutional, and recreation uses. This rezoning would provide walkable commercial services to nearby residents at a location where there are currently few services within walking distance. The proposed site plan balances the need for area services with a design that respects the residential character of the area.	
CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION		
	Positive Aspects of Proposal	Negative Aspects of Proposal
	The request would encourage redevelopment of an underutilized site.	The request would add a significant number of trips to area roads.
	NCDOT roadway improvements at this location will increase vehicular capacity and improve traffic flow, allowing for more intense development.	
	The request would provide additional walkable commercial development in an area with current services.	
SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL		
The following conditions are proposed from interdepartmental review comments to meet established standards or to reduce negative off-site impacts:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><u>PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF COMMERCIAL INFRASTRUCTURE PERMITS:</u><ul style="list-style-type: none">a. The developer shall submit a stormwater management study for review by the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved. Relocation or installation of any stormwater management device into any buffer areas or existing vegetated areas designated to remain, or in close proximity to adjacent property with residential zoning, shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum and may require a Site Plan Amendment.b. The developer shall obtain a commercial infrastructure permit from NCDOT and WSDOT; additional improvements or fee-in-lieu may be required prior to issuance of the commercial infrastructure permits. Required improvements or fee-in-lieu for project may include:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Provide left and right turns on Thomasville Road• Driveway connection to Clemmons Road should be right-in/right-out only.		

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
 - a. Developer shall record a negative access easement along the frontage of Thomasville Road and East Clemmons ville Road.
 - b. Building materials for the Shopping Center, Small shall comply with the following standards:
 - Only the following building siding materials shall be allowed:
 - Brick and brick veneer;
 - Stone, stone veneer, and cultured stone;
 - Precast concrete panels provided they are textured and contain architectural detailing;
 - Concrete Masonry Units (CMU) provided they are split face and textured;
 - Fiber Cement Siding (Hardie Board);
 - Glass;
 - Stucco with architectural detailing; and
 - Wood.
- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE(S) OF OCCUPANCY:**
 - a. The developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit(s).
 - b. All commercial infrastructure permitting must be completed for Phase 1.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; the City-County Planning Board makes final recommendations, and final action is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, which may approve, deny, continue, or request modification to any request. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES FOR W-3651 JUNE 12, 2025

Daniel Roberts presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR:

Scott Miller, representative and landscape architect for property owner.

- Mr. Miller provided a brief overview of the rezoning request.

Abdul Qureshi, petitioner and property owner.

- Mr. Qureshi provided an overview of the proposed rezoning request.

Phillip Summers

- Mr. Summers provided his support for the rezoning request.

AGAINST:

Sharon Diane Wright

- Ms. Wright expressed her concerns regarding the proposed rezoning request, citing traffic issues related to the traffic circle being constructed by NCDOT at the intersection of Thomasville and Clemmons Roads.

Joyce Bowles

- Ms. Bowles stated concerns about the possibility of increased traffic in the area and the negative impact of construction on local animal habitats. Additionally, if the rezoning is approved, Ms. Bowles was also concerned about what type of businesses will be located in the development and whether there will be any security at the proposed businesses to reduce the potential for burglaries in the area.

Dr. Dennis Bishop

- Dr. Bishop, a local pastor, agreed with previous statements about concerns of increased traffic related to the proposed rezoning request.

James Cockerham

- Mr. Cockerham expressed his opposition to the proposed rezoning request due to concerns about increased traffic. Mr. Cockerham commented on the existing traffic patterns which include road use by local school buses.

Jeri Wagner

- Ms. Wagner stated concerns about the traffic flow shown on the proposed site plan and was also concerned about the possibility of an increase in traffic due to the proposed rezoning request.

WORK SESSION

Mr. Murphy clarified that the traffic circle shown on the proposed site plan is being constructed as part of a separate NCDOT intersection improvement project. Mr. Alex Stone from WSDOT addressed the Board's questions regarding these improvement plans and how they would affect the proposed rezoning request. Mr. Steelman inquired if the TIA took the NCDOT improvement project into account, to which Mr. Murphy replied affirmatively. Mr. Grubbs and Chair Leak discussed how communities change over time and the Board is ultimately responsible for making decisions based on the best use of the land.

MOTION: Jason Grubbs recommended that the Planning Board find that the request is consistent with the comprehensive plan.

SECOND: Jack Steelman

VOTE:

FOR: Walter Farabee, Jason Grubbs, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Salvador Patiño, Lindsey Schwab, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

MOTION: Jason Grubbs recommended approval of the zoning amendment.

SECOND: Jack Steelman

VOTE:

FOR: Walter Farabee, Jason Grubbs, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Salvador Patiño, Lindsey Schwab, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

Chris Murphy, AICP/CZO
Director of Planning and Development Services